THE DYSFUNCTIONAL POLICE OFFICER:
MANAGEMENT STRATEGIES FOR THE FUTURE

AN INDEPENDENT STUDY
TECHNICAL REPORT

Greg A. Janke
Command College Class 15
Peace Officer Standards and Training
Sacramento, California
January 1993
This Command College Independent Study Project is a FUTURES study of a particular emerging issue in law enforcement. Its purpose is NOT to predict the future, but rather to project a number of possible scenarios for strategic planning consideration.

Defining the future differs from analyzing the past because the future has not yet happened. In this project, useful alternatives have been formulated systematically so that the planner can respond to a range of possible future environments.

Managing the future means influencing the future--creating it, constraining it, adapting to it. A futures study points the way.

The views and conclusions expressed in the Command College project are those of the author and are not necessarily those of the Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training (POST).
THE DYSFUNCTIONAL POLICE OFFICER:
MANAGEMENT STRATEGIES FOR THE FUTURE

"Whoever fights monsters should see to it that in the process he does not become a monster"

-Friedrich W. Nietzsche, Philosopher
1844-1900
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

SECTION ONE: Introduction ................................................. 1

SECTION TWO: Futures Study ............................................. 7
  Issue/Sub-Issue Development ........................................... 7
  Qualitative Field Interviews ......................................... 7
  Statement of Sub-Issues .................................................. 9
  Development and Forecasting of Trends and Events ................. 10
    Nominal Group Technique (NGT) ....................................... 10
      Trend Selection ................................................... 11
      Event Selection .................................................... 11
      Trend Forecasting and Discussion .................................. 12
      Event Forecasting and Discussion ................................... 18
  Cross-Impact Analysis ................................................... 24
  Scenarios ........................................................................ 26
    Hypothetical Scenario .................................................. 27
    Exploratory Scenario ................................................... 29
    Normative Scenario ..................................................... 30
  Policy Considerations ................................................... 32

SECTION THREE: Strategic Plan ........................................... 34
  The Environment ............................................................ 34
    Macro-Mission Statement .............................................. 34
    Micro-Mission Statement .............................................. 35
  Situational (WOTS-UP) Analysis ......................................... 35
    External Environment ................................................... 35
    Internal Capability Analysis ......................................... 37
      Organizational/Internal Strengths ................................... 38
      Organizational/Internal Weaknesses ................................ 38
  Strategic Assumption for Surfacing Technique (SAST) .............. 40
  Stakeholder Analysis ..................................................... 40
  Alternative Strategy Development ....................................... 43
    Alternative #1 ........................................................... 44
    Alternative #2 ........................................................... 45
    Alternative #3 ........................................................... 46
    Alternative #4 ........................................................... 48
LIST OF TABLES AND ILLUSTRATIONS IN THE TEXT

Tables:
Table One: Trend Evaluation and Forecasting Table ..................... 13
Table Two: Event Evaluation Table ........................................ 19
Table Three: Cross Impact Evaluation Matrix ............................. 24
Table Four: Commitment Chart ............................................... 58

Figures:
Figure One: Trend One ....................................................... 14
Figure Two: Trend Two ....................................................... 15
Figure Three: Trend Three ................................................... 16
Figure Four: Trend Four ..................................................... 17
Figure Five: Trend Five ...................................................... 17
Figure Six: Event One ......................................................... 20
Figure Seven: Event Two ....................................................... 20
Figure Eight: Event Three .................................................... 21
Figure Nine: Event Four ....................................................... 22
Figure Ten: Event Five ......................................................... 23
THE DYSFUNCTIONAL POLICE OFFICER:
MANAGEMENT STRATEGIES FOR THE FUTURE

SECTION ONE:
INTRODUCTION
The Dysfunctional Police Officer:
Management Strategies for the Future.

Law enforcement performs a vital function in a modern society. The services performed by law enforcement officers enable civilization to flourish by helping it set aside basic safety and survival needs. The public comes to hold its protectors to an even higher level than it holds itself.

The public has a right to expect that those who are motivated to work in the field of law enforcement do so with integrity, devotion, and trust. It is with little doubt that the public reacts with such concern when police officers become involved in incidents of excessive force, scandal or other indiscretions. Such incidents often are highly publicized by an unsympathetic media.

An often cited quotation that such events stem from "a few bad apples" expresses a sentiment that some officers may be predisposed to trouble.

In reality, the same vulnerabilities present among society at large are also present among its protectors. About 23% of the general population have emotional conflicts which are considered severely limiting. Given this, it is reasonable to expect that police officers working in an environment of stress and hardships would at least be prone to the same level of emotional conflict as those in less turbulent environments.¹

The effect law enforcement service has on the individual officer was identified in a study that found 12% of 300 surveyed officers had symptoms of Post Traumatic Stress Syndrome, similar to that found in combat veterans.²

Such vulnerabilities among police officers in general have potentially negative effects upon the performance of the individual officer, the functioning of the employing agency, and of course to the community as well. These and other factors result in the emergence of the dysfunctional police officer.

The author offers the following definition of the dysfunctional police officer:
The dysfunctional police officer is one affected by conditions: behavioral, psychological and/or attitudinal, which result in individual performance which is contrary to the goals of the police organization or to the community as a whole.

It becomes increasingly critical in the future for the modern law enforcement agency to play an active role in recognizing these vulnerabilities and in taking a proactive role in managing its personnel resources.

Successful management of the issue of dysfunctional police officers is an important part of maintaining the confidence and trust placed in law enforcement by its constituency.

The consequences of losing this confidence can be significant. In June, 1992, for example, voters in Los Angeles overwhelmingly approved the most far reaching legislation in 70 years aimed at police reform. According to the Mayor of Los Angeles, these reforms were targeted at the issue of police accountability largely resulting from perceptions stemming from the Rodney King incident and the ensuing riots.3

Many bills were introduced in 1991 by legislators in California reacting to public pressure concerning instances of police misconduct. Many of these bills involved removal of traditional police discretionary powers and targeted the strong fraternal relationship among peace officers thought to impede reporting of acts of misconduct.4

Following the widely publicized King incident, the Christopher Commission was appointed to conduct an independent assessment of the Los Angeles Police Department (LAPD).

In published writings, the Commission concluded that "police work modifies behavior. Many emotional and psychological problems may develop during an officer’s tenure on the force. Officers may enter the force well suited psychologically for the job but may suffer burnout, alcohol-related problems, cynicism, or disenchantments, all of which can result in poor control over
behavior". The conditions leading to dysfunction may be associated with factors not necessarily stress or psychological in nature.

As many officers choose to commute to work in the cities which employ them, the bulk of contacts with their communities often come from negative work experiences. This may result in feelings of separateness from the communities being served.

Police often find themselves at the center of social change. These and other changes can result in turmoil to the police officer who has an inherent interest in maintaining stability. Changes may result, particularly in veteran officers, in a sense of alienation and frustration both toward their jobs and toward the police organization. The long term effects of such alienation are reduction in productivity, burnout, and development into the problem employee.

Cynicism also plays a role in the emergence of the dysfunctional police officer. Cynicism is discernable in every branch of law enforcement. Levels of cynicism in police officers coincide with age and experience. It seems to be a learned attitude as part of the socialization process beginning in the recruit stage and can grow into resentment and aggression later as the officer experiences frustration with the system. Cynicism also is found evenly among male and female officers.

Left unaddressed, cynicism may progress to a stage called anomia. Anomia is a condition characterized by the absence of standards, by apathy, confusion, frustration, alienation and despair.

The cynical officer may become a malcontent who withdraws and seeks comfort among peers sharing the same views. These malcontented officers may, in turn, form a delinquent subculture. Such a scenario may have catastrophic consequences to the law enforcement agency. The results of widespread cynicism among police officers may have the impact of creating or magnifying public hostility, scandal, and rampant inefficiency.

Law enforcement has traditionally used citizen complaints to
identify problem officers. This system is flawed as it places the burden not upon police management but instead upon the public.

Other traditional means are likewise ineffective in identifying the dysfunctional police officer. Performance evaluations of problem officers are often very positive, and contain complimentary and optimistic comments of the officer's future success within the department.

Some agencies are taking a role in pioneering non-traditional means of identifying problem or dysfunctional police officers. The City of Long Beach has developed an approach called the Early Warning System or EWS. The EWS program identifies officers on the basis of their extent of involvement in incidents including complaints, shootings, and other situations to a degree which flags them as a potential problem employee. Those officers receive counselling and retraining as a preventive response.

Programs such as EWS are innovative but tend to be reactive. They fail to proactively address the gradual slippage of an officer toward the dysfunctional level until their performance reaches some predetermined threshold.

Wellness programs have proliferated in recent years and provide counselling and other services to police officers. Voluntary counselling programs are ineffective. In many cases, the officer will not recognize that he or she is experiencing emotional problems. According to a recent survey, only 10% of officers take advantage of psychological support services provided by their agencies.

Psychological testing may have some utility in predicting those officers who could be expected to have emotional problems. Ongoing testing may become a valuable component of the management of police officers in the future.

The need for a drastically different approach in the role of police management is necessary. This approach must address the alienation, hostility and other conditions which contribute to development of the dysfunctional police officer.

The emergence of trends, which will be discussed later in this
project, will illustrate a view of the future which will be less tolerant of the traditional response law enforcement has taken in this area.

The behavior and conditions which lead to dysfunction among police officers are an impediment to reaching the higher levels of organizational effectiveness and consequent community satisfaction. The impact of the dysfunctional police officer upon the future of law enforcement is potentially significant as communities may grow tired of scandal and constant barrages of media coverage of police misconduct. The issue of what leads to the development of the dysfunctional police officer has been developed in research. The question is raised as to how law enforcement can manage the conditions and resultant behaviors better in the future.

Future management strategies are needed in order to ensure that the public will receive quality law enforcement services by motivated and capable officers capable of controlling or resisting those behaviors that lead to dysfunction.

This study will examine the future environment for law enforcement over the period of the next ten years with the objective of defining those strategies which may play roles in management of the dysfunctional police officer.
THE DYSFUNCTIONAL POLICE OFFICER:
MANAGEMENT STRATEGIES FOR THE FUTURE

SECTION TWO:
FUTURES STUDY
The Dysfunctional Police Officer: 
Management Strategies for the Future

The study of this issue is oriented toward a future world in an dynamic, constantly changing environment. The focus of the futures study is an analysis of this environment, as it relates to the issue over a ten year period.

The management of the dysfunctional police officer is one which is likely to be a major law enforcement management issue in the future. This study will seek to illustrate that the issue is one of great future relevance to law enforcement. It will strive to suggest credible strategies which may be valuable in guiding law enforcement management through the next ten years concerning management of personnel resources better to help prevent, identify, and treat the conditions leading to the emergence of the dysfunctional police officer.

The futures study portion presents an analysis of the issue and develops related sub-issues. Trends which may influence and events likely to impact the issue as well as forecasts of the probability are also components. Three scenarios were also developed which provide glimpses of futures based on forecasted views.

Having completed these objectives, the remainder of the project will look toward the creation and implementation of strategies which may play a role in the successful management of the issue.

A. ISSUE/SUB-ISSUES DEVELOPMENT

Literature scanning was used to provide background information on the subject and resources which were used to educate the author concerning the issue as well as positions concerning it.

The author also conducted a series of qualitative field interviews with six persons selected on the basis of knowledge, professional expertise or significant contribution to the issue.
A series of six questions were formulated and presented in person to each person. The full list of persons interviewed and their individual responses are contained in Appendix A.

A. In your opinion, is the current level of management of the issue adequate?

Those interviewed were in consensus that the issue was important to the future of law enforcement. Five of the six answered that the current level of management was inadequate. The remaining person thought the current level was adequate but that the future would probably necessitate changes.

B. What trends do you feel may occur which will change the way police management views the issue?

All but one person cited social issues as the most significant trends which may effect the issue. Loss of public confidence, trust, and pressures for law enforcement to be more responsive were examples. One person identified economics as impacting the issue making it necessary to better manage costs associated with, or stemming from, actions of the dysfunctional officer.

C. What results could be found in changes in the management of the issue?

Social issues were listed by all respondents as significant areas of benefit. Reduced police/public suspicion, improved public support of the police, and lower personnel costs resulting from a motivated and sincere police workforce were cited.

D. What do you feel might be the consequences of law enforcement’s failure to manage the issue?

Significant political and public attention directed at the police could result from failure to manage the issue. This could translate into reduced discretionary powers of police management resulting from politically imposed mandates, increased personnel costs and civil judgements. Civil unrest and greater distrust of the police were also cited.

E. What do you feel are viable alternatives which might be considered in the future management of the issue?

All respondents recommended suggestions oriented both
toward prevention and improving police management’s response toward problem officers. Suggestions ranged from improving pre-hiring screening, extending treatment and counselling programs throughout the officer’s career and improving wellness programs to include families. Use of systems to more closely monitor performance was also identified.

F. Where do you think challenges to changes in management of the issue may come from?

The majority readily identified police labor as the most likely source of obstruction. Entrenched police management and other officials lacking vision were also identified.

Personal interviews of selected persons involved professionally in different facets of the issue also contributed to the final formulation of the issue as one of emerging importance and relevance to law enforcement. These persons included police psychologists, personnel managers, management consultants, community members, command level police managers and a Sheriff.

The following sub-issues were then developed:

1. What role may law enforcement management play in preventing and detecting dysfunction in the future?
2. What occurrences are likely to develop which may influence changes in management of the issue?
3. Where might challenges to changes in the management of the issue come from?
4. What is the likely result of the failure of law enforcement to adequately manage this issue?

Each of these sub-issues represents topics which are important to the complete analysis of the issue and will be discussed throughout the study.

A futures wheel is a device which graphically illustrates the relationship between the issue, sub-issues and other relevant subjects. The futures wheel for this study is shown in Appendix B.
B. TRENDS AND EVENTS DEVELOPMENT AND FORECASTING

Following selection of the issue and sub-issues, several steps were followed to further explore the issue and to forecast forces which may have an impact upon it.

1. Nominal Group Technique (NGT):

As an important part of the futures study process, a Nominal Group Technique (NGT) Panel was convened to collectively develop lists of trends and events which may be present in the future or develop in the future and which would have an impact on the issue. These trends and events will be used in forecasting, creation of future scenarios and other elements later in the study. By definition, an "event" is a measurable singular occurrence which when combined with other events may effect or exert influence resulting in a "trend".

The NGT Panel consisted of community leaders with backgrounds in policy formulation, implementation, and public service. While representation from law enforcement management was necessary because of the nature of the issue, care also was given to maintain a balanced perspective in the NGT Panel through the inclusion of community and civic leaders. The composition of the NGT Panel was:

1. Brook McMahon. Police Chief, City of Pismo Beach and a Graduate of the Command College.

2. John Eastman. Assistant City Attorney, City of Lompoc.


4. Dave Stern. Lieutenant, Santa Maria Police Department.

5. James Hall, an attorney in private practice.

6. Frank Priore, Assistant City Administrator, City of Lompoc.

Trend Selection:

The individuals in the NGT Panel were solicited to nominate non-directional trends for later forecasting. A list of twenty two trends was developed and narrowed by voting to twelve. A screening process reduced the number to five trends selected for forecasting using a criteria of relevance to and impact upon the issue. The full list of the candidate trends generated by the NGT Panel is in Appendix C.

The five top trends, listed in the order the NGT Panel placed upon importance to the issue, were:

TREND ONE: Concern for mental health issues of police officers.

TREND TWO: Changes in complexity in the role of police officers.

TREND THREE: Employment standards for police officers change.

TREND FOUR: Ethnic/cultural conflicts.

TREND FIVE: Funding of police services.

Event Selection:

Using an event nomination and voting process, twenty one candidate events were developed by the NGT Panel and reduced to five events using a criteria of high probability of occurrence and impact on the issue. The full list of candidate trends is also shown in Appendix C. The events chosen by the NGT Panel shown in the order of importance were:

EVENT ONE: POST mandates periodic psychological testing for police officers.
EVENT TWO: Court rules that psychological testing violates individual privacy rights.

EVENT THREE: Initiative passes limiting civil liability awards.

EVENT FOUR: Mandated employee assistance programs (EAP) for public safety employees in high stress jobs.

EVENT FIVE: State Supreme Court issues ruling that individual rights are subordinated by public welfare.

2. TRENDS FORECASTING AND DISCUSSION:

The NGT Panel then shifted roles to become a Forecasting Group. The Forecasting Group conducted an assessment of the selected trends and events and assisted in forecasting each to the year 2002. The following discusses the importance and impact of each trend and event on the issue and the results of the forecasting process.

The five selected trends contribute to reflect a future in which law enforcement and society may undergo, both positive and negative changes. Such changes may affect not only the ability to perform the basic mission of law enforcement but also impact how the issue may emerge and the response of police management to it.

Each of the five selected trends was forecast from the level estimated to have existed five years ago to where the Forecasting Group thought the trend will be (the exploratory future) five and ten years into the future. The Group also estimated where they thought the trend should be (the normative future) five and ten years ahead. For comparison, a present day constant of 100 was assigned each of the five trends. The median forecasts from the Forecasting Group are shown in Table One.

(The responses from one Group member were consistently excessive in contrast with the other 7 members during the trend forecasting process and were eliminated to prevent skewing.)
## TABLE ONE
### TREND EVALUATION AND FORECASTING

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FORECAST PANEL MEDIANS</th>
<th>LEVEL OF THE TREND (Today=100)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TREND STATEMENT</td>
<td>5 YEARS AGO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T1: Concern for mental health issues of police officers.</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T2: Complexity in the role of police officers.</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T3: Employment standards for police officers change.</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T4: Ethnic/cultural conflicts.</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T5: Funding of police services.</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(N=7)

Exploratory Future: "Will Be"
Normative Future: "Should Be"

The following is an analysis concerning each of the trends and the forecasts and influences each might have on the issue according to the author based upon comments from members of the NGT Panel and Forecast Group. Figures illustrate each trend as forecasted showing the high, median and low estimates of the level of the trend in the exploratory future and the median forecast in the normative future.

**Trend One: Concern for Mental Health Issues of Police Officers**

The Forecast Group expressed a high level of concern regarding the well being of police officers working in the future.
The median level of this trend was estimated by the Group to be 65 five years ago and is the second lowest level of all five of the forecasted trends. The median normative forecast rose to a high of 200, or the highest level of all trend forecasts at the ten year mark. This forecast reflects how rapidly the issue is emerging and the importance the Forecast Group placed on the management of this trend.

Prompt response to this trend may positively influence the issue through increased programs and benefits for police officers as a means of mitigating job related psychological or emotional problems. This trend may also indicate a greater liability to and a responsibility role for police agencies in maintaining the mental health of police officers, also positive influences on the issue.

Creative alternatives to traditional disciplinary approaches to the dysfunctional officer may emerge as a result of this trend.

**Trend Two: Complex Roles of Police Officers**

The second trend reflects an attitude that policing, and the role of the police officer in the future will increase in complexity.

American cities are undergoing changes. For example, violent
crime has increased at a rate of 22% in the period between 1980 and 1990. In addition, the media regularly reports stories describing deterioration of American cities, homelessness and drug abuse. These forces could change the traditional role of the police officers in the future.

Changes in the traditional roles of law enforcement in the future could bring greater roles in dealing with mentally ill, drug offenders, and rapidly changing demographics may occur in the future. The police officer working in this environment may find his/her ability to adapt difficult.

The median forecasts of both futures were in close proximity, with the normative future slightly higher reflecting that police officers in the future should be of greater sophistication to deal with the pressures perhaps resulting from this trend.

**Trend Three: Employment Standards for Police Officers Change**

The quality of police officers in the future could have an impact on the study issue. Higher quality personnel could be more capable of meeting the challenges of the future and less susceptible to negative or destructive influences and pressure.
Whether such applicants continued to be attracted to law enforcement careers is dependant upon a number of factors such as attractive compensation, a positive perception of the police in the community and other issues.

A lessening of standards could influence the issue by bringing lower quality personnel into law enforcement. These personnel could be less thoroughly screened and perhaps less resistant to dysfunctional tendencies and influences which would exacerbate the need to management the issue in the future.

The normative forecast indicated that higher standards were desirable in the future as a positive response to the issue.

**Trend Four: Ethnic/cultural conflicts**

The Forecast Group estimated the level of this trend 5 years ago at the lowest of all trends, with a median of 60. This illustrates that this is a rapidly evolving trend.

Law enforcement is often on the edge of societal changes. Changes in demographics often result in friction with law enforcement. Law enforcement continues to be met with suspicion by members of minority communities. Continued rapid evolution of
this trend and racial unrest in cities as witnessed in the early 1990's might result in increasing suspicion, frustration and alienation between police and the community. This could effect the issue by placing officers in an hostile environment possibly resulting in increased cynicism from a constantly changing, hostile and inhospitable environment.

**Trend Five: Funding of Police Services**
Predictions reflect continued economic difficulties for California for several years.\textsuperscript{33} The availability of monetary resources for use by law enforcement is likely to increase over the period of this study, according to the Forecast Group.

Depending on the actual future of this trend, the issue may be affected greatly based upon availability of funds used to pay for management strategies to deal with the issue. This trend may also have an adverse influence upon the other forecast trends. For example, funds for salaries necessary to attract quality personnel (Trend Three) and for costs associated with addressing concern for the mental health of police officers (Trend One) may not be present due to costs associated with management of this issue.

The forecasted level of this trend in the exploratory future rose to 150 in five to 200 in ten years. This is the highest level of all five forecast trends. The normative median of this trend was 125 in five and 150 in ten years, which compared to the exploratory median suggests that crime and the necessity to fund law enforcement should be less than they probably will be.

3. Event Forecasting and Discussion:

The Forecast Group rated each event by probability of occurrence (0-100 percent) five and ten years into the future and the degree of impact (positive or negative) if the event occurred. The number of years into the future that the probability of each event occurring would exceed zero was estimated. The median forecasts are shown in Table Two.

The five events selected for forecasting demonstrate the volatility of the issue. Two of the five events have major impacts on the issue yet are in contradiction. For example, Event One mandates psychological testing for police officers while Event Two cites a legal ruling that such testing violates privacy rights.
### TABLE TWO

**EVENT EVALUATION TABLE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EVENT STATEMENT</th>
<th>YEARS UNTIL PROBABILITY EXCEEDS ZERO</th>
<th>5 YEARS FROM NOW (0-100)</th>
<th>10 YEARS FROM NOW (0-100)</th>
<th>IMPACT ON ISSUE AREA IF THE EVENT OCCURRED</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>E1: POST mandates periodic psychological testing.</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E2: Courts rules psych testing violates rights.</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E3: Initiative passes limiting civil liability.</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E4: Mandated EAPS for police officers.</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E5: Court rules over individual rights.</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>37.5</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*(N=8)*

---

**Event One: POST Mandated Periodic Psychological Testing for Police Officers.**

Symptoms or conditions of dysfunction may be identified through testing. According to the Forecast Group, some form of periodic psychological testing to assess and treat disorders may be mandated for police officers as a response to the issue.

Because of costs and resistance principally by labor to this event, the probability was moderate (45%) in five years but changing to a high probability (82%) in ten years. The ten year probability was the highest forecast of the Group.
This event was also estimated to have a high positive impact of 7 on the issue. A negative impact of 5 was estimated due to the cost and internal turmoil likely to result from implementation of testing and the expense associated with addressing those who are found to have detectable psychological problems.

**Event Two: Courts Rules that Psychological Testing Violates Individual Rights of Privacy.**
The implementation of mandated psychological testing of police officers could be an issue that could be impacted by legal opinion. Protection of individual rights, particularly privacy rights has been a long tradition in the United States.\textsuperscript{35}

Within a probability rising from moderate (45\%) in five years to moderately high (72\%) in the next ten years some likelihood existed that a court could render a decision interpreting psychological testing as an intrusion on individual privacy. A median negative impact of 7 and a 0 positive impact was estimated as law enforcement could lose a valuable tool to deal with the issue.

**Event Three: Initiative Passes Limiting Civil Liability Awards**

A popular uprising on the subject of liability awards may result in passage of an election initiative limiting or restricting civil judgements. Concern for liability and related costs could be the driving force in changes to management of the issue.

In demonstrating the rapid emergence in this topic, civil judgements against the Los Angeles County Sheriff's Department increased over 500\% in the period between 1988 and 1991.\textsuperscript{36}
The effect of a reduction in liability exposure may be a lessening in urgency to manage the issue since agencies may not feel the pressure to avoid law suits. This event was judged as having a relatively low probability in five years (40%) but climbing moderately in ten years to 60%.

**Event Four: Mandated Employee Assistance Programs (EAP)**

*for Public Safety Employees in High Stress Jobs.*

Concerns to assist and/or accommodate police officers and others in high stress jobs may increase to the point that EAP Programs may be mandated. While the notion of mandatory submission to counselling may seem intrusive on an officer's privacy, courts have applied a "compelling need" test where the benefit of the public is at stake.\(^\text{37}\)

This event is also reflected in a forecast trend showing a high degree of concern for mental health issues of Police Officers (T-1). For this reason, the positive impact was rated moderately high at 7. A negative impact of 3 was estimated with cost being a major factor. This event had a 50% probability in five and a 67% median probability in ten years.

22
Event Five: State Supreme Court Rules Individual Rights are Subordinated by Public Welfare

Public demands for protection from increasing crime or social upheaval may be noted in policy making, legislative and legal circles. This could be result in legal judgements, laws, and trends toward subornation of the rights of individual officers if the good or safety of the public is served.

A positive impact may result as police management could have more latitude to deal with the issue as privacy rights of officers might be reduced and traditional management prerogatives might be restored.

This event might impact negatively on the issue as police agencies may feel relieved somewhat from the need to manage dysfunction as the public may be more tolerant of misconduct if it translates into greater safety.

Some significant trend such as high rises in crime or major social unrest would be necessary to influence such a decision as only 37.5% median probability was estimated in five years and slightly higher that half (55%) in ten years.
C. CROSS IMPACT ANALYSIS:

CROSS-IMPACT EVALUATION MATRIX
Table Three

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>N=3 Panel Median: Maximum Impact (% change +/-)</th>
<th>Impact Totals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>**</td>
<td>E1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E2</td>
<td>-100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E3</td>
<td>-30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E4</td>
<td>+60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E5</td>
<td>+30</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Impact Totals

4  2  1  3  0  5  4  4  3  4

** LEGEND:

Events (actors):
E1 Mandated psych testing
E2 Psych tests violate rights
E3 Limits to civil liability
E4 Mandated EAP Programs
E5 Court rules individual rights second to public

Trends (reactors):
T1 Mental health issues
T2 Complexity of police
T3 Employment standards change
T4 Ethnic-cultural conflicts
T5 Costs for police services.

An analysis was conducted of the impact of the forecasted events and trends that were selected for forecasting. A consensus group of three police managers was used in the cross impact analysis.

This analysis assesses the degree each forecasted event, if it actually occurred, would impact the other events and the trends at the point of maximum impact. This is measured in the Impact Total column and reflects "hits" or number of events and trends impacted.

The events listed vertically are "actors" while the events and trends listed horizontally are referred to as "reactors". The
number of "hits" is a indicator of events which show the greatest impact upon other events and trends.

This analysis is shown in Table Three: Cross Impact Evaluation Matrix.

**Event 1: Mandated Periodic Psychological Tests:** This is a major "actor" event having an impact on seven of the nine "reactors". Mandating the periodic psychological testing of Police Officers would most dramatically impact Event Two: Psychological Testing Violates Rights (+80%); Event Four: Mandated EAP's (+70%); as well as Trend One: Concern for Mental Health of Officers (+70%). These are significant levels and show the importance of this event on the issue.

A conflict between this as an "actor" and Event Two: Psychological Testing Violates Rights as a "reactor" would exist as the mandating of testing would create a dilemma since Event Two actually would prohibit such testing. This hit is rated as a +80% since it would set up a circumstance which might lead to some ruling permitting such testing for Police Officers thus negating Event One.

This "actor" event would have a negative impact on Trend Five: Costs for Police Services (-50) as the mandatory testing could significantly increase costs associated with treatment or accommodation of personnel manifesting dysfunctionality.

**Event 2: Psychological Testing Violates Rights:** A significant "actor" as it would have an impact on seven of the nine "reactors". All seven hits were rated as negative. A ruling which would prohibit psychological testing may have a devastating impact on the issue. Event 2 had the highest possible negative impact (-100) on Event One: Mandated Psychological Testing of Officers as it could eliminate a valuable tool which would play a significant role in management of the issue.
Event 3: Limits to Civil Liability: The placing of limits on civil liability awards, while not directly related to the issue, was assessed as impacting six of the nine "reactors". Liability is seen as a major driving force toward changes in the management of this issue in the future. Limits on liability exposure could decrease management interest in managing the issue, as shown by a negative impacts on four of six "reactors".

Event 4: Mandated Employee Assistance Programs: This "actor" would have an impact on six of nine "reactors", five of the six hits being positive. Police officers would have greater access to assistance which in turn would positively impact the issue. The only negative was concerned with cost impacts.

Event 5: Individual Rights: While not a direct impact on the issue and only impacting four of the nine "reactors", all four being positive, Event Five could impact on the issue. This event represents a major legal ruling which may be interpreted as deemphasizing the individual rights of police officers in areas such as privacy or submission to testing or treatment and perhaps strengthening police management's ability to manage dysfunctional employees.

D. SCENARIOS:

Three scenarios were prepared as a means of exploring what the future of the issue might be ten years ahead. Each scenario was created using data collected through literature scanning, expert interviews, events and trends forecasting and the cross impact analysis.

These scenarios examine three hypothetical futures:

1. Hypothetical Future: illustrates a "what if" scenario where the future is played out and the
major trends and events, those with the most "hits" in the cross impact analysis, occurred with maximum impact.

2. **Exploratory Future**: showing a glimpse of what the future "will be" in a surprise free environment.

3. **Normative Future**: this scenario illustrates a desired and attainable future by showing what the environment "should be".

**DATE:** December 12, 2002  
**PLACE:** Surfside, California

1. **Hypothetical ("what if") Scenario:**

**Headlines:**


Crime was rising and the problems police were having with recruiting, negative media coverage and with labor costs were publicly debated. Liability settlements were consuming larger parts of city budgets as each year passed. How could cities continue cope with scarce tax revenue while paying for increasing costs of law enforcement?

The increasingly complex role the police were playing in our cities stimulated much controversy. Citizens expected and paid higher taxes for police service yet were dissatisfied with the barrage of stories, news accounts and headlines about police scandals, huge liability judgements and stress settlements.

There were many changes occurring in our cities. Surfside,
like many other cities, was becoming increasingly multi-cultural, and with that came increased friction between many groups, often focusing on the police. While society changed, so did the police. Law enforcement was not an attractive career as it once was. The quality of new officers was dropping at a time when communities needed them better than ever.

Turnover was becoming a very disruptive problem and many Police Departments were at acute staffing levels. Officers were leaving due to the low pay, morale, stresses of the job and dissatisfaction with a thankless job.

Cities tightened their belts and diverted more money to law enforcement in an effort to respond to public discontent. Some of this money made its way to salaries and the turnover rate slowed slightly. Seeing this as a positive trend, some cities began strengthening their employment standards to address their police personnel problems.

The state Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training (POST) began public hearings on mandating annual psychological examinations for all police officers in 2003. This was intended to detect and treat problem officers but had another unanticipated effect. Police labor groups became politically active as they saw increasing trends toward erosion of their privacy rights.

A large police labor group, filed suit against the Surfside Police Chief for requiring officers to submit to mandatory psychological testing and counselling. The court ruled in favor of labor and further said that Police Departments should recognize the stresses of the job and institute immediate Employee Assistance Programs or be liable for damages.

This matter was pursued by the League of California Cities and appealed on behalf of the City of Surfside. In 2002, the State Supreme Court agreed to hear the case and ruled that, particularly in public safety, individual rights are secondary to the public good. This helped management with its goal of psychological testing but ushered in serious police labor turmoil.

In 2001, an initiative was passed which placed limits on civil
liability stemming from greater settlements against government, particularly police departments. While this was relief for the taxpayer, it did little about resolving police personnel problems responsible for many of the settlements. Most agencies felt relieved of liability exposure and began scaling back many of the programs designed to assist officers with the stresses of the job.

2. **Exploratory ("will be") Scenario:**

**Headlines:**


Although the Surfside Police Department continues to receive annual budget increases, often at the expense of other city departments, community satisfaction levels however are low. People are impatient at low levels of service while paying more in taxes, of which greater percentages go toward paying for multi-million dollar settlements from police abuse and misconduct cases. The prospect of controlling such settlements by passage of Proposition 144 in the 2004 election may help to reduce these costs but will it solve the problem?

Many people support and are sympathetic about the police, especially since the role of police officers have become so much more difficult and complex in recent years. Public concern exists for the numbers of officers retiring out on disabilities. There is not so much sympathy however, for the growing numbers of officers the public reads about in ceaseless stories about scandals, excessive force and negligence involving law enforcement officers. Agencies have attempted to maintain and even increase standards for
police officers as a response to the problem however most find it very difficult to attract interested applicants. How long can high standards be maintained while positions sit vacant?

Many agencies have experimented with different approaches such as biofeedback, psychological profiling, acupuncture and contract employment. The cost is high and hard to justify, particularly in times of scarce public funds with few immediate results from the investment. Most stayed with traditional programs like Employee Assistance Programs and discipline to mitigate these problems. Police labor pressure over privacy rights also has made it difficult to extend counselling and treatment programs to all officers. Many management efforts to address these problems end up challenged by police labor in the legal system. The preferred method of treatment continues to be discipline and legal action, inspite of the negative publicity that is generated.

Such publicity tends to fuel already strained relations with the minority communities already sensitive about relationships with law enforcement as many of the press accounts of police beatings, shootings and other incidents involve minority groups. Many heavily minority areas are seeking to break away from large cities and form their own government and law enforcement agencies.

3. Normative ("should be") Scenario:

Headlines:

"Surfside Chief proposes new plan to City Council to help officers/control costs", Surfside Inquirer, January 6, 2002

"A city that cares: What the Surfside, California is doing to keep cops on track", Newsweek Magazine, August 4, 2002


Morale hit a low ebb in 1992. Disability claims due to stress shot up and so did turnover in police ranks. The media was having a field day with the police; allegations of scandal, corruption, brutality, and unethical cops out of control were spotlighted as
regular features on the news. The job was indeed more complex as officers were working in more hostile environments with less community support. Police liability settlements were also consuming scarce dollars, although an initiative was passed a few years later made more money available to local law enforcement.

Following heightened concern for issues of the welfare of officers working in these environments, many agencies took the lead in the early 1990’s with innovative approaches such as Community Policing. Early Warning Systems (EWS) tracked officers to identify those thought to meet a problem profile and referred them to counselling programs or other mitigation efforts. Voluntary Employee Assistance Programs (EAP’s), once luxuries for only a few agencies as recently as 1992, became widely available. Since most voluntary programs attracted very little interest among officers reluctant to use them, police labor and management in Surfside cooperated to devise an innovative program which requires officers and their families to regularly meet with specialists to work on personal and professional problems.

It was clear law enforcement could no longer merely hire recruits, train them and turn them loose on the streets for 20 years particularly in today’s world of greater demands and complexity of the police role. Agencies recognized the obligation to care for officers beyond providing health and dental insurance.

The Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training convened a committee of selected Command College graduates, representatives of police labor groups and other key experts. The group published a study in 1999 which was critical of the traditional police personnel practices of "hire 'em, train 'em, then forget 'em". Innovative remedies were proposed by the POST committee and quickly adopted by a wide range of agencies. Programs included job matching and periodic rotation, a new POST certificate program for community involvement, and greater access to psychological testing and treatment and counselling of officers.

Academies responded by revising curriculum to introduce recruits to basic sociology, cultural awareness, and community
interaction to alleviate cynicism and alienation. A pre-graduation internship sent recruits into the community to work with different groups. Of course these were expensive steps for many agencies and the state. Law enforcement, in concert with police labor cooperation, enjoys well earned community support and continues to be one of the most effective segments of government.

E. POLICY CONSIDERATIONS:

Several important areas should be considered in the development of policies intended to deal with the issue. These areas include:

Performance Assessments. Present methods of performance assessment are reactive and appear to be ineffectiveness in identifying the problem officer.

Police Labor. Most strategies intended as management responses to the issue will likely be perceived with suspicion by officers, both individually and collectively through organized labor groups. Sensitivity to the interests of labor, and to recognize the power latent in labor should be prominent parts of any implementation plan.

Management Considerations. Research has shown that the issues of police dysfunction are of great depth and complexity. Efforts to manage this issue should be undertaken with the understanding that there are few quick fixes to measure success. Implementation of strategies are likely to be lengthy undertakings with no immediate pay off.

Cost. The establishment of detection, prevention and treatment programs will be expensive. After such programs are enacted, it is a certainty that many officers will require lengthy follow up and potentially even retirement depending upon the magnitude of problems.

Legal issues. Many management strategies to this issue may involve questions of employee privacy rights, and other sensitive areas. Litigation may play a part in attempts to implement strategies.

The author selected the normative or "should be" scenario for strategic planning. This scenario provides a glimpse of an
desirable future which is attainable with prudent and responsible management of the issue.

In addition, Trend One: Concerns for Mental Health Issues of Police Officers, was also shown through forecasting and cross impact analysis to be one of great potential impact to this issue. This trend will also be a focus of the strategic plan.
THE DYSFUNCTIONAL POLICE OFFICER:
MANAGEMENT STRATEGIES FOR THE FUTURE

SECTION THREE:
STRATEGIC PLAN
The Strategic Plan will illustrate a means of planning a management strategy to the issue in the context of a hypothetical medium sized California police agency. The object of this strategic plan will be to show a path to a desired goal and to facilitate the occurrence of the future as depicted in the normative scenario.

Surfside Police Department

Surfside, California is a growing community of 85,000 residents. A generation ago Surfside was one of several small agricultural communities on the central coastal region. The community has been traditionally conservative and slow to embrace change. Although many of the long time residents remain active and influential in the political scene, the community is experiencing change.

The Police Department was founded early in the century and in the last 20 years the department has grown 300 percent. In recent years the department has been in the center of the community spotlight. Residents have become alarmed at the infusion of metropolitan crime problems such as gangs, homelessness and increases in the immigrant population.

Concern has surfaced in light of an increase in complaints against the police. A highly publicized scandal involving several officers, later fired and prosecuted, has also stimulated discussion in the community. Some segments of the community are advocating greater civilian participation in police management review of complaints.

Although historically understaffed, the Police Department has been successful in meeting the challenges of recent years. The department has the reputation of being very efficient and cost effective in response to limited funds. Crime rates approximate those of neighboring cities.

A. Mission Statement:

The macro-mission statement for the Surfside Police Department guides the department toward the future:

"This agency is dedicated to the protection and preservation of life and property in our community. Our mission, in partnership with an active and informed citizenry, is to work tirelessly toward the goal of maintaining a sense of safety and security for our residents and for the community as a whole"
A micro-mission statement was prepared by the author, more specific to the issue encompasses the topic of this study and would be valuable in guiding the agency in the achievement of the strategic plan:

"This agency places great value in maintaining the public trust. We recognize the need to be constantly vigilant in ensuring that we continue to perform our duties as public guardians with clarity of purpose, integrity and accountability both individually and organizationally. We must take an active interest in the management of our personnel resources as they are the bridge to fulfillment of our mission."

B. WOTS UP/SITUATIONAL ANALYSIS:

This analysis follows the "WOTS UP" (Weakness; Opportunity; Threats; and Strengths) methodology which examines the external and internal environment of the issue in Surfside.

A consensus group of five members of law enforcement, including representatives of management, supervision and field personnel and a member with a police labor perspective were utilized in this analysis.

1. External Environmental Analysis

The first assessment surveyed the trends and events developed in the futures study. Taking a view of the external environment, the panel helped to identify opportunities as well as threats which could impact the achievement of the mission in Surfside.

INDIVIDUAL RIGHTS: The movement towards individual rights has been reflected nationally in the Civil Rights Act of 1991 and the Americans with Disabilities Act. This trend, one with a long tradition in the United States, is a distinct threat to the management of dysfunctional police officers. Individual rights trends tend to bring restrictions and mandates to management
authority and may impair management of the issue.

ACTIVISTS: Activism by extremist groups tend to involve vocal and often sensational criticisms of law enforcement. Activists also tend to be suspicious of government and have exploited recent events occurring in Surfside and well publicized incidents in larger cities involving police scandal. Media coverage can play a role in altering public perceptions of the police and erode public/police relationships. This is a threat as it may indirectly perpetuate the causes of dysfunction and distract attention away from management of the issue.

PUBLIC ATTITUDES OF POLICE: Not so long ago, widespread community support was enjoyed by the police. Community attitudes toward the police were seen as the difference between police (good) and criminals (bad).

Today, the distinction is blurred and public attitudes are more of skepticism. The panel cited this as an opportunity as police management should be stimulated to working harder to be more responsive to the citizenry and to maintain and improve on positive attitudes.

QUALITY OF POLICE PERSONNEL: Recent experiences in Surfside has seen a reduction in qualified applicants for a number of reasons. While deteriorating public attitudes may be a temporary phenomenon, the effect on recruitment must be considered.

Qualified applicants are dissuaded from pursuing police careers due to negative peer pressure following the recent scandals. Selection of inferior quality police officers may result from the continuing need to maintain staff levels and is a threat as dysfunction may worsen.

Should quality applicants continue to enter the profession, an opportunity should exist. Applicants would theoretically be both more receptive to management of the issue and resistant to dysfunctional inclinations.

PROTECTION SHIFTS TO SERVICE: Moving police officers away from the paramilitary role of crime containment toward more Community Oriented Policing strategies and problem resolution
should be an opportunity. This may help to place officers more in touch with the community and may provide more positive contacts, intrinsic rewards, and personal fulfillment.

**POLITICAL ATTENTION:** This aspect is considered a threat as misconduct and negative incidents involving police personnel could energize political forces. This could have the adverse effect of limits in the latitude of police management in the administration of the agency and personnel and outside political interference.

An opportunity may exist as political interests may support innovative means intended to manage the issue.

**CIVIL LIABILITY:** Communities employing police officers should be negatively impacted by the threat of civil liability exposure. This creates an strong opportunity to the issue as a means of controlling such liability and associated costs. Liability issues often result from actions by police officers, thus pressure exists to manage the related liability exposure.

**PUBLIC FUNDING AND REVENUE:** Scarcity of public funding may be a threat as funds which otherwise might be available to fund approaches to the issue and attract and retain quality personnel are diverted to more immediate needs. An opportunity should exist if revenue is available thus allowing funding of programs which could deal with the issue.

Short term thinking may deny access to funds to manage the issue. Such funds would likely have great long term benefits which are hard to measure in the short term thus difficult to obtain.

**RISE IN CRIME:** Increases in crime may be a threat to the issue as preoccupation with crime may bring increased tolerance of the impacts and results of dysfunctional police officers. An opportunity may result however as more attention and perhaps even sympathy is given to help officers seen as casualties of the crime battle.

2. **Internal Capability Analysis**

Key organizational aspects were considered by the consensus group either as strengths or weaknesses which might affect the
issue at the Surfside Police Department.

a. ORGANIZATIONAL/INTERNAL STRENGTHS:

The Police Department has been traditionally well regarded in the community. Its relations with the news media and its general image among most residents is very good. Occasional letters to the editor of the local newspaper critical of the department frequently bring an outpouring of letters of support. Historically, the City Council and city manager have held the Police Department in high esteem and has left its management to the Police Chief.

The Police Chief has been visible in the community seeking to reinforce the reputation of law enforcement and of his department. He is also seen as a skilled leader and has been well received particularly among the older residents.

The Police Department tends to retain experienced personnel who are well compensated. This experience translates into competent and loyal supervisors and management staff.

Applicants are thoroughly tested and extensive background investigations screen out all but the best candidates. Quality of most police officers is high. The department often conducts two or more testing cycles to fill vacancies with the best personnel.

The Police Department has a comparatively low rate of sustained citizen complaints. Although the number has risen in recent years, those that result in suits are thoroughly investigated and handled with high quality contract attorneys. Most claims die out in the legal process however the rate of payout on such claims and suits has risen slightly.

Relations between the Chief of Police and the POA are very good. Only a handful of grievances have been filed in the last decade. Almost all were resolved internally to mutual agreement.

b. ORGANIZATIONAL/INTERNAL WEAKNESSES:

The Police Department has been chronically understaffed
resulting in high workloads for most personnel, especially those in administrative positions.

While all supervisors and managers reside in the immediate area, a growing number of new officers are recruited from outside the area and choose to reside in larger cities 20 or more miles away. Involvement in community activities and organizations is only found among management level staff.

Due to perpetually tight budgeting, the Police Department has very limited public relations. An understaffed unit shares time between DARE and all other public and crime prevention activities resulting in a minimal community presence.

While the experience level is relatively high, a constant turnover occurs among younger officers. The average age is under 26 and the experience level is less than 4 years for non-supervisory line officers. A certain cynicism persists among the younger officers which impairs two way communication. Several powerful informal leaders have influence in the popular interpretation of policies and serve as role models for some of the younger officers.

The organizational culture of the department stresses a strong enforcement philosophy, contrary to a more moderate tone set by management. This has resulted in increasing complaints and friction particularly among the minority community. Management handling is seen by line officers as a lack of support from police administration.

Training is often limited to meeting POST and legal mandates and supervisory staff receive only basic supervisory skills training upon promotion. Non-mandated training is justified in terms of reducing liability rather than strengthening skills.

While few workmen's compensation/disability claims are filed in the Police Department, the city philosophy seems to be to settle rather than fight such claims.
C. STRATEGIC ASSUMPTION FOR SURFACING TECHNIQUE (SAST):

Utilizing the consensus group, a SAST analysis was then undertaken to identify major stakeholders; individuals, groups or entities, who could be impacted or have an impact on the issue.

Stakeholder identification is important as an element in the formulation of the strategic plan. Twelve selected key stakeholders are listed below. The full list of stakeholders developed by the panel is found in Appendix D.

While many stakeholders and their respective assumptions can be predicted with some accuracy, other stakeholders' positions may be less certain. The term "snaildarters" is a descriptive euphemism to identify those stakeholders which may have an unpredictably significant impact on the strategic plan.

Those stakeholders thought to have the greatest impact on the strategic planning of the issue, along with their anticipated assumptions are as follows:

1. **Chief of Police:**
   A. Concerned about image of the Police Department in the community.
   B. Will seek a lead role in implementing strategic management plan.
   C. Knows many management strategies to issue will be controversial.
   D. Highly interested in success of management plan.

2. **City Manager:**
   A. Concerned with controlling costs/risks associated with police officers.
   B. Tendency to avoid controversy.
   C. Sees the Police Department as a strong potential liability source.
   D. Will insist on being informed about progress of management plan.
3. **City Council:**
   A. May be prone to "quick fix" of the problem.
   B. Will not seek involvement in direct management but will desire to be informed, particularly about costs.
   C. May suddenly change positions.
   D. Highly influenced by public opinion.

4. **Police Management Staff:**
   A. Supportive of the Police Chief.
   B. Will be involved in operation of programs.
   C. Innovative.

5. **News Media:**
   A. Supportive of police but gives full coverage to negative police events.
   B. Can be very influential to public opinion.

6. **POST:**
   A. Can play major role in coordinating and studying the issue and in making recommendations.
   B. Credible/influential to policy makers.
   C. Usually supportive of innovation.
   D. Some funding availability.

7. **Community Activists:** The "Snail Darter"
   A. Suspicious of police.
   B. Tirelessly seeks civilian oversight or control.
   C. Promotes view of individual rights/privacy issues.
   D. May take interest in strategies as admission that unsuitable Police Officers are employed.
   E. Could form alliance or be sympathetic with police labor on issue of privacy rights.

8. **Police Officers:**
   A. As individuals, will be directly involved in all management strategies.
   B. Some strategies likely to conflict with the "Code of Silence".
   C. Will be split on acceptance of strategies.
   D. Skeptical.

9. **Surfside Police Officer’s Association (POA):**
   A. Represents officers collectively.
B. Platform for extremist positions by members to be given legitimacy.
C. May exploit access to media, legal, legislative or union resources to resist.
D. Likely to resist any strategies that restrict.
E. Communications medium for Police Chief.
F. Can be irrational, emotional.

10. Families of Police Officers: Another Snaildarter!
A. Influenced by spouses however likely to admit that help is needed. May accept many elements of the program.
B. Interested in some programs, particularly counselling and wellness.
C. Potentially powerful and emotional force could oppose steps which may affect their lives.
D. Unpredictable. May resist.
E. Positions may be based on biased information.

11. City Personnel Administrator:
A. Should work closely with police administration and other professionals involved in management strategies.
B. May stress confidentiality of personnel issues which may be impediment.
C. Will have significant interest in success of the strategies.

12. Contract Police Psychologist:
A. Highly credible.
B. Strong interest in issue.
C. Willing to help develop or assess programs.
D. Will be involved in many strategies.
E. Desire successful outcome.
F. Capable of networking with other medical and psychological professionals.

Assumption mapping is a useful tool in charting the anticipated positions of stakeholders and in identifying the "snaildarters". An assumption map is found in Appendix E reflecting the anticipated assumptions of the selected stakeholders.

The twelve selected stakeholders are grouped according to the assumptions each is anticipated to have concerning the issue:
Supportive:
- Police Chief
- City Manager
- Police Management Staff
- POST
- Psychologist
- Personnel Administrator
- City Council
- News Media

Oppose:
- Police Officers
- Police Officers Association

Unknown Position:
- Community Activists
- Families of Police Officers

D. Alternative Strategy Development:

This phase of the strategic plan involved the use of a Modified Policy Delphi Group consisting of ten persons selected on the basis of their expertise in areas of government, law enforcement management, personnel management and counselling.

Drawing upon its diverse experience the Group generated a list of twenty nine policy alternatives, each having some relationship to the management of the issue.

Through a rating process, the list was reduced to four prominent policy alternatives selected on the basis of feasibility and desirability to address the issue at the Surfside Police Department. The full list is found in Appendix F.

The four selected alternatives are:

1. Development of a system of periodic performance assessments of police officers at intervals during their careers.
2. Creation of programs to place officers in closer relationships with community or civic organizations.
3. Enacting contractual employment options for police officers.
4. Periodical psychological reassessment of police officers at intervals during their employment.

The following describes each of the four policy alternatives selected by the Modified Policy Delphi Group along with identified
advantages and disadvantages.

Policy #1: Development of a system of periodic performance assessments of all Surfside Police Officers at regular career intervals considering performance, disciplinary history, and conduct an update of background investigation files.

This alternative recognizes that most police officers upon entry into law enforcement have survived an intense screening process. As the officer progresses through his or her employment, other factors also come into play which sow the seeds of dysfunction. Burnout, alienation, suspicion and frustration play roles in decreasing an officer’s effectiveness.

For many officers, the future promotion is an adequate incentive to maintain a favorable role in the organization. Not all officers however are motivated by such an incentive.

This policy alternative responds to concerns for increased mental health and wellness issues for police officers (Trend One) which will move the organization toward the desired normative scenario.

Advantages:

- Monitors officers through their careers.
- Proactive approach to the issue.
- May have long term impact on managing labor costs.
- Early identification of problems.

Disadvantages:

- High cost potential.
- May be seen as reactive.
- Resistance from labor is likely.

Police officers, families and labor stakeholders are likely to oppose this alternative. This alternative is an improvement over the traditional practice of ignoring police officers until a problem manifests. It is likely, however, to be seen as placing officers under more intense scrutiny and may be perceived in a negative light as reactive rather than preventative.
In order to gain the acceptance of most key stakeholders, this alternative should be structured to stress more treatment and assistance to street officers rather than a performance review process. A peer representative may help to overcome labor objections however this raises new questions such as elitism or abuse of perceived authority.

Policy #2: Creation of a program stressing community involvement by adoption of a practice of assigning patrol officers to working positions within community or civic organizations periodically during their career. Such positions would be temporary assignments.

Law enforcement by its nature perpetuates distance, alienation and lack of positive rewards or satisfaction for officers. Such conditions are exacerbated by the "commuter cop" phenomenon and distancing which results from officers working in communities they know very little about.

Creating closer personal contacts between individual police officers and the community would be a significant preventive effort in countering factors such as alienation and cynicism which may lead to dysfunction.

This policy alternative suggests temporary reassignments of police officers to a Community Liaison Bureau which would match the officer as a police/government representative to established civic groups such as an "Adopt a Cop" program in schools, "Police Coordinator" in local neighborhoods, or as volunteer or advisory board members for local Food Banks, Special Olympics, etc.

The officer could become involved in the organization by attending board meetings, and otherwise adopt the organization for the duration of the assignment.

**Advantages:**

- Creates ownership/reward system between officers and the community.
- Bridge between community and the Police Department.
Disadvantages:

- Cost inefficient. Removes officers from their basic duties.
- Criticism from groups not selected for participation.
- Police Department has no control over actions/roles of the organization, thus creating a potential for conflict should the organization become involved in a controversial issue.
- Likely to be resisted by police officers who would ridicule such assignments.

This policy alternative could be a positive response to factors identified in the Futures Study such as ethnic/cultural issues (Trend Four), and the changing complexity of police duties (Trend Two) witnessed by the popularity of community policing style programs today.

The motive of this alternative is to have a positive effect on the attitudes of police officers and addresses concerns from Trend One: Concerns for Mental Health Issues of Police Officers.

Cost being a major factor, this alternative would probably not obtain ready approval of stakeholders associated with government management (Police Chief, City Manager, City Council). It would probably be viewed favorably among some, such as among the community activist stakeholders.

Policy #3: Enacting contractual employment system for Surfside Police Officers. Renewal would be based upon maintaining satisfactory work performance and an assessment of suitability for continued employment.

The standard probationary period monitors progress when the new officer is presumably least affected by dysfunctional tendencies. Traditional annual performance reviews are inadequate as they tend to evaluate limited criteria over the recent past.

Under current practices once probation ends, the officer is presumed to have prospects for continued employment through retirement age. This policy alternative proposal takes a view that the responsibility for continued employment is an individual issue.
and that a contract renewal process would provide an incentive for continued satisfactory work. Those not meeting standards, the employee with tendencies toward dysfunction, would be weeded out through non-renewal of the employment contract. Continuing employment based on contractual review may be an adequate incentive.

**Advantages:**

- Removal process would be simplified through non-renewal of contracts.
- Officers would be motivated towards continuing employment, thus actively managing the conditions which may lead to dysfunction.

**Disadvantages:**

- Monitoring performance and managing and renewing the contract would be a significant administrative burden.
- May be detrimental to recruiting by failing to attract applicants wishing to be able to make long term economic and lifestyle planning.
- Labor resistance could be severe.
- Investments in experienced personnel could be lost should contracts not be renewed.

Stakeholder reaction would be mixed. Again, police labor, officers and families would be very resistant. The prospect of forming an alliance with the community activists (a "snaildarter") may occur amid allegations that the "establishment" is trying to implement some devious plan. Another "snaildarter" which may emerge are the families of police officers who would very likely see this alternative as a threat to their economic future. Wielding an emotional and impressive power, the image of mothers pushing strollers with protest signs outside the council chambers while the TV cameras roll would unnerve even the toughest politician.

Outright support of this alternative would be unlikely from any stakeholder sensitive to controversy.
Policy #4: Creation of a Program of Scheduled Psychological Reassessments and Referrals. Occurring At Two Year Intervals Testing for All Surfside Police Officers will Detect Any Adverse Deviation From Baseline Psychological Testing Conducted At the Time of Appointment.

This policy alternative is predicated upon the notion that many factors which lead to dysfunction are detectable or preventable through testing and counselling.

Significant expense may result when, from the heightened scrutiny advocated in this alternative, an officer is determined to be unsuitable for continued employment. Short term cost might threaten the feasibility of this alternative.

This policy alternative could be an appropriate response to strong concerns for increased mental health and wellness issues for police officers as identified in the Cross Impact Analysis. It might be negatively impacted however by Event Two which was forecasted to reflect infringement on privacy rights from mandatory psychological testing.

Advantages:
- Oriented toward detection and treatment of conditions.
- Shows the Police Department as concerned for the well being of officers.
- Police officers, families and labor could be skeptical but a logical argument could win support. Community activists may be supportive.

Disadvantages:
- Cost may be high.
- Only oriented toward those conditions treatable through counselling. Confidentiality concerns may impede feedback.

City management could be resistive to this alternative, considering costs, unless clear advantages justified the expense. Concerns about maintaining confidentiality should be addressed in order to obtain support of police officers, and police labor.
These stakeholder groups are prominent in resisting many aspects of attempts to manage the issue as described in the Exploratory Scenario and should be considered powerful forces.

1. **Strategy Selection for Implementation:**

Although each of the proposed policy alternatives address portions of the issue from different viewpoints, none are complete responses to the issue.

For this reason, the four policy alternatives presented above were synthesized into a program which should begin implementation within the Surfside Police Department in the year 1995. This policy would also help to avoid occurrence of the future as shown in the exploratory "will be" scenario which resulted largely from untimely or inadequate management of the issue. This is not a contract employment program thus facilitating acceptance of the police labor stakeholders. Although a proactive program, it does however contain a feature that would involve, in exceptional cases, discharge of unacceptable personnel for not meeting standards.

The following is selected as a comprehensive response to the issue:

**THE CODE FOUR PROGRAM**

The **CODE FOUR Program** is oriented toward prevention and early identification and response to conditions professionally determined to be indicators of dysfunctional tendencies. The family will be included as the individual officer's primary support group.

The **CODE FOUR Program** is comprised of assessments and counselling scheduled at two year intervals.

1). **Psychological Component:** Working with a psychologist, a professional update will compare current results against baseline psychological testing accomplished at the time of appointment. Such testing would have the purpose of identification of emerging
psychopathology or inclinations toward psychopathological disorders, i.e., amorality, anomia, or other conditions or inclinations tied to the emergence of dysfunctionality. A partial list of currently available tests is located in Appendix G.

In addition, the psychologist will have clinical interviews with the officer and later with the family to provide opportunities to provide or recommend counselling assistance or provide feedback.

2). Professional Component: A performance assessment measured against the desirable standards developed beforehand will be conducted using a panel representing management, supervisory and peer levels of the organization and staff psychologist. Goals will be set with the officer to achieve in the period until the next assessment and feedback provided.

A satisfactory evaluation in the CODE FOUR Program would clear the officer to continue for the next two year period and to work toward goal achievement. A system of pay or assignment incentives would serve to motivate officers to achieve a satisfactory rating.

A marginal evaluation would mandate the officer to complete a course of monitored rehabilitation, counselling or other conditions as recommended by the assessment panel.

A mentoring program would be a part of this program. Mentor officers would be selected as positive role models and would work with officers toward achievement of goals and a satisfactory rating.

Unfavorable evaluations would indicate a serious history of misconduct or other performance which indicates the officer is beyond corrective efforts or failing to meet job dimensions. Such evaluations could terminate employment. The possibility of eligibility for retraining or other entitlements were not forecast to change in the future. An appeal process would be a required
step prior to involuntary separation.

The value of the Code Four Program, however, is the stressing of success through early identification, prevention and treatment. The available literature noted in the research of this study suggests few efforts traditionally to mitigate dysfunctional tendencies or causes until the crisis stage. This program aims to change this.

Central to the success of this policy alternative is a strong wellness program which is readily available to the officer and family at minimal or no cost during the interim periods between assessments. It should be structured to provide support to the officer in working towards a satisfactory assessment rating.

The goal setting component recognizes a link between job satisfaction and favorable performance. The objective of goal setting is to foster a personal interest in the development of the individual police officer. Educational achievement, community involvement and participation in the operations of the department should be significant individual goals.

Short term costs associated with the Code Four Program could be potentially significant. As a future response to emerging trends and events, this program could actually be cost effective by prudently managing those areas which result high management costs. A sample cost/benefit analysis is located in Appendix H.

2. Implementation Plan:

The Chief of Police will be responsible for developing the concept and selling the concept to the City Manager, City Council and soliciting support for its implementation among the key stakeholders. The Police Officer’s Association will require special skills on the part of the Police Chief in order to obtain their acceptance.

To gain acceptance of this policy, incentives or assurance would be necessary for incumbent officers concerning participation
in the program. Failing this, the program could be targeted at new officers appointed following the implementation date.

The CODE 4 program will be based on a seven year timeline discussed later in the transition management plan. (See Appendix J).
- Research/Negotiation Phase: 2 years
- Implementation Phase: 4 years (including 2-2 year assessment cycles).
- Analysis/Review: 1 year.

It will be administered jointly by the Police Department and the Personnel Department, through a professional consultant firm specializing in personnel issues. This implementation timeline will provide for a two year research/negotiation phase, two year assessment cycles and a one year period to review the data.

Funding will be allocated in part by the City of Surfside, the health insurance carrier and the city’s wellness provider. Since substantial monetary payments rise from police personnel cases, funding from insurance companies would be aimed at reducing long term costs. POST will be invited to monitor the program for application statewide and may have some funding for start up costs.

E. NEGOTIATING ACCEPTANCE OF THE STRATEGY:

Once formulated, proper negotiation of the selected strategy is critical to its successful implementation in the form desired by proponents. Anticipation of the positions of the key stakeholders, both those supporting, opposing and those with an unknown position are important in the formulation of a negotiations plan.

The Chief of Police will be driving force in formulation and proposal of the policy and in overseeing the negotiation process.

The following summarizes the position of the Police Chief concerning the negotiation of elements of the selected policy:

1. The wellness component is part of a total physical/mental health concept however is not considered critical. This component should be desirable for the police stakeholders and thus used as a chip to gain their acceptance of other
parts of the program.

2. Composition of the assessment team may be negotiable. Management and supervisory representation in the majority on the team is essential and thus not negotiable. A police labor representative or community member on the panel is negotiable.

3. The assessment intervals were established based on research and are important to the timeline. These are not negotiable.

4. Psychological assessments is the central part of the strategy and is not negotiable.

5. Performance assessments is important toward the total program, however, it can be amended or dropped to gain acceptance of the psychological retesting component. In this event, performance testing could be established at a later time to complete the program.

Performance dimensions which will be used to evaluate performance should be established with inputs from police labor. The involvement of labor in development of these dimensions could be valuable in obtaining support for the program.

6. The subject of job guarantees to incumbent officers rated unsatisfactory is negotiable. It is likely that a hardline on this part would generate resistance from police labor which could be sufficient to delay or kill this program.

The first position of compromise should be to offer some incentives, such as extending the wellness program to families.

This component could be deleted from the proposal but would have a dramatic impact on costs which would be incurred through disability retirements of officers found unsuitable for continued employment. The better strategy would be to negotiate acceptance of this element by offering a program of graduated incentives to those who are rated satisfactory, which would be the vast majority of officers.

The following identifies the key stakeholders who will play a part in the negotiations process and some basic strategies which may be utilized:
City Manager: As the first step in the negotiations process, the Chief will present the initial proposal to the City Manager for approval. The Chief should address interests of the City Manager in terms of cost containment, liability control and prevention of controversy.

It would be wise for the Manager to present a proposal to the Council which would responding to concerns of accountability of the Police Department voiced by the public. The alternative of a plan developed outside the Police Department is far less satisfactory.

City Council: As elected policy makers from different backgrounds, these stakeholders probably have limited knowledge of law enforcement and related complex personnel issues. The negotiations strategy must consider the positions of each councilmember and make the proposal consistent with their individual views.

Further progress in implementation of the strategy in the proposed form is dependant on gaining acceptance of the majority of these persons.

It is likely that the Council may direct that some program be developed to address this emerging issue. It is far preferable to have an internally developed plan adopted rather than some politically motivated alternative.

The following stakeholders are anticipated to take positions of opposition. Possible negotiations strategies are outlined:

Police Officers: Many will be suspicious of the strategy. This strategy should be communicated in positive terms that this group will understand and relate to. Many will be resistant to the performance reviews and working with an outside counselling/consulting firm. The majority view will probably target termination of unsatisfactory evaluations with some paranoia that this could be abused to fire unpopular
officers.

This group will probably accept this after receiving guarantees that portions of the assessments will be confidential and that issues of job guarantees be resolved.

**Police Officer's Association:** Board of Directors will be a moderating force due to their direct contact with the Chief and/or the negotiators. This medium should be maximized in order to facilitate communication with the police officers and police families stakeholder groups. A vocal minority may be very resistant to virtually all components of the strategy and may use many different tactics to block it. This group will not be accessible by the Chief and may be successfully managed through peer pressure by gaining acceptance of the majority through proper management of the negotiations process.

Acceptance may be facilitated by presentation of the problem, the proposal and the anticipated outcome in terms that this group may understand. For example, it may be helpful to play out a hypothetical scenario describing potential results from failure to effectively manage the issue and to relate this to possible future impacts on the street level officer.

A unilateral imposition of the proposal is possible but would not achieve the goal of gaining acceptance. To do so could result in serious internal labor issues and negate any value anticipated from the strategy.

The positions of the following stakeholders are not known. These stakeholders, as "snaildarters", could have highly unpredictable positions on the strategy and thus should be considered in development of any negotiations strategy.

**Police Families:** Are likely to have serious and irrational concerns about job security which is the basis of being a "snaildarter". Once this concern is addressed, this group may
be more accepting and would probably no longer be regarded as threatening the policy.

Spouses and children may resort to emotional displays and public showings which could develop into a serious challenge to the strategy. If opposition by this group materializes and poses a serious threat to the proposal, it may be difficult for the Chief of Police to communicate with this stakeholder group. Communication through the police officers and POA would be most likely to influence this group.

**Community Activists:** This group could emerge on either side of the issue, as a champion at police reform or through alignment with police labor in opposition of intrusion on privacy rights of officers.

A credible and influential representative of some faction of this group could be invited to participate in establishing the performance dimensions which could provide a bridge to this stakeholder group. Community involvement would be desirable to broaden the perspective in establishing these dimensions.

The next phase is the Transition Management Plan which will carry the selected strategy through the implementation process.
THE DYSFUNCTIONAL POLICE OFFICER:
MANAGEMENT STRATEGIES FOR THE FUTURE

SECTION FOUR:
TRANSITION MANAGEMENT PLAN
The transition management portion of this project will carry
the policy alternative selected in strategic management of the
issue into implementation in the City of Surfside.

A. Critical Mass Analysis:

The implementation of this plan is dependant on understanding
who the "key players" are and what their anticipated level of
commitment may be to the policy. An understanding of the minimum
level of commitment for the success of the plan is necessary for
key stakeholders.

The term critical mass is used to describe those who are
considered crucial to the successful implementation. A useful
method of assessing the current and required level of commitment
for each of the members of the critical mass is through the
construction of a Commitment Chart. (See Chart 4).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Actors in the Critical Mass</th>
<th>Level of Commitment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Block Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Police Chief</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Police Management</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. POST</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. City Manager</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Mayor</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. President, Police</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Officer’s Assoc.</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Police Informal Leaders</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

X = Current Commitment
O = Required Commitment

The following discusses approaches which could be undertaken
in order to move each member of the critical mass from the current
to the required level of commitment.
Police Chief: The Police Chief is committed to making change happen and will be the central initiator of action toward proposing, gaining commitment, and moving the change through transition.

Although he will not directly manage the change, he will navigate it through the other critical mass members early on and maintain a limited involvement during and after implementation mostly by monitoring the policy. His conviction to the change, his energy and leadership will help to mitigate anxiety and suspicion and begin the movement of the actors of the critical mass toward the required levels of commitment.

It is advisable for the Police Chief to focus this change as a response to some event or significant trend in order to illustrate need and thus justify the change to facilitate its acceptance.

Police Management: The middle management team of the Surfside Police Department is comprised of two Commanders who are likely to be initially skeptical towards the strategy. As it is impractical for the Police Chief to be directly involved during the entire transition, both Commanders must be supportive. Both will be highly involved in the initial research, proposals and management of the change. Both Commanders must be moved to the position of make things happen. Their commitment is also essential as they must communicate confidence and acceptance of the proposal to others.
The Police Chief will be responsible for gaining the required commitment of both Commanders to the position of make things happen. This could be accomplished by sharing his vision of the emerging trends and the exploratory or hypothetical scenarios which illustrate the possible results of failure to act. The Chief's persuasive abilities and high level of credibility will also facilitate the acceptance of the change by the management staff.

POST: The level of commitment from the leadership of POST to the change is at the help change happen level which is at the required level.

POST should be represented through the assignment of a Consultant to facilitate the acceptance of the change among the other members of the critical mass by representing the high level of credibility and legitimacy of POST.

The POST role will also be to serve as a reference, connect with resources, expertise and in the providing evaluation and feedback.

City Manager: The City Manager is a management professional acutely aware of the liabilities to the city. She is also aware that the Police Department is a significant risk both in terms of possible community/ethnic unrest as well as to the financial health of the city. The City Manager, second only to the Police Chief, is aware of the necessity to actively manage the issue.
The City Manager must be in a position of helping change. The Police Chief must gain her approval in order for the proposal to go any further or for the expenditure of funds.

In order to maintain her commitment, the Police Chief must be certain that the City Manager is aware of all of the potential problems, costs and benefits of the change. Discussion of the future impact on the city concerning judgments, liability and controversy related to the issue concerning the Police Department should result in her commitment to the change.

The Mayor: The Mayor is a strong leader in the community and represents many of the old line business and agricultural interests. He reflects the trends toward government cost containment, government accountability, and concern for widely publicized accounts of police misconduct while being a strong advocate for law and order. This dissatisfaction with the status quo will be helpful in obtaining his commitment.

The City Council will be asked to take a bold step in approving this change and may encounter efforts from other members of the critical mass to block the change. The leadership the Mayor has provided will be of great influence in obtaining the commitment of the City Council. He must be moved to a position of help change happen, tasks which will be the responsibility of the Police Chief and City Manager.

Focusing the Mayor on significant trends which necessitate the change and the anticipated returns from a successful implementation
should achieve the required commitment. He should support a credible strategy which will address these issues, so long as concerns of the rank and file Police Officer are addressed. Cost should be shown in terms of investing in a long term plan.

**Police Officer’s Association (POA) President:** As an elected representative, the POA President is an actor in the critical mass. He is certain to have a strong commitment to block change particularly in regards to job security and expanding management's rights over the rank and file.

This critical mass actor could be expected to have a predictable pro-union view to be suspicious of "hidden agendas" or politically motivated plots. This could impair the movement of this actor’s commitment to the required level.

This actor must be committed more than merely letting change happen. He must be moved toward commitment to help change happen by obtaining a sense of "buy in" through consultation with the Police Chief and by having the opportunity to represent the POA by working toward the development and implementation of the proposal.

The Police Chief should build a close, trusting professional relationship with the POA President which provides the maximum opportunity to communicate.

**Police Informal Leaders:** The commitment of the Police Officers is critical to the success of the change. Several informal leaders lie within the ranks who must be committed to help
change happen in order to influence and thus gain the acceptance of other officers to the change.

Through the efforts of the Police Chief, his management staff and with the assistance of POST, this group must be convinced that the status quo is unacceptable. Emerging trends concerning the issue will pose an equal or greater threat if not understood and acted upon in advance. Use of scenarios will help to illustrate this.

Their commitment to the change could be obtained by promoting understanding in the proposal, its likely benefits to the officers and families, and in providing an opportunity to impact the transition through their feedback and negotiation.

B. Transition Management Structure:

The proposed change will be controversial as issues of job security and intrusion into personal lives are associated with the change. For the Surfside Police Department to unilaterally impose this change would be to impair and probably guarantee its tumultuous failure. Such is the case of many unplanned transitions. The dynamics of change are often traumatic to the organization and prone to misinterpretation. These factors must be recognized in the transition of this program.

Changes typically occur in phases: 1). The pre-change state, 2). the transition state, and 3). the post-change or future state.

The flow of this change will move through these three stages
in the transition structure. The following structure was created mindful of the controversial reception that this change will likely encounter in the early to mid-stages of transition. This structure will provide a high degree of attention from the Police Chief to gain acceptance of the concept. It should involve and gain commitment from the critical mass and other stakeholders in the transition, and to move into a planned and organized maintenance in the post-change state.

1. POLICE CHIEF: As shown in the strategic plan and the critical mass analysis, the Police Chief will be highly involved in the pre-change and early in the transition state.

The Police Chief must focus on illustrating the need for the change, preferably by using some significant event or in the absence of one, a significant trend, to illustrate dissatisfaction with the status quo.

The organizational culture of the Police Department must also stress excellence and professionalism. This will facilitate acceptance of a policy aimed at enhancing these important qualities. It is advisable for the Police Chief to inventory the culture of the department and embark early in efforts to bring about the desired changes.

He must also gain the commitment of his management team early on and meet with the City Manager, POST and City Council to obtain their commitment and acquaint them with the change prior to moving on. POST should be visible in the early stages and continue
involvement through to the project management stage. This visibility will facilitate commitment from other critical mass members due to the reputation POST has earned as a highly credible and non-politicized criminal justice planning agency.

The Chief will relinquish direct involvement to the Transition Management Team as commitment grows and implementation nears. To maintain the credibility of the change, he will maintain visibility and share his vision through the transition.

2. **TRANSITION MANAGEMENT TEAM**: The Chief will organize a transition management team chaired by a commander. Desired qualities are credibility, a good communicator with good consensus building skills and eager to accept challenges. With the Chief's vision and empowerment, the manager will develop a team made up of representatives of selected members of the critical mass and other stakeholder constituencies.

Participants will be invited to work with the other members of the transition management team on the basis of their abilities to strengthen commitment and/or to provide meaningful assistance in the structuring the change as it moves toward implementation. A timeline with recognized milestones, will be developed by the transition management team.

The transition management team must retain and share the vision of the results desired from the change. The team must resist any significant alteration away from the original goal, which may occur during consensus building with stakeholders. A
continued communication between the transition manager and the Police Chief is essential, particularly in areas where amendment or alteration is suggested.

The negotiation of the acceptance of the policy with the police labor stakeholders will be necessary. The Transition Manager, with a designated representative of city management, will negotiate and strive to obtain commitment with the POA toward implementation.

3. **PROJECT MANAGER**: A project manager will be appointed to operate the change following the successful progression of the policy from the pre-change through the transition stage.

Given his earlier involvement, the transition manager should remain in the lead position by moving to project manager.

Under the direction of the project manager, various individuals and entities will have responsibilities for portions of the continued management of the project.

The project manager will also be responsible for monitoring the change in order that it remains within the desired goals and provide feedback to the Police Chief.

**C. Technologies/Methods:**

The following is a description of the technologies and methods which can be utilized in the management of the transition, stressing prevention of conflict, uncertainty and feedback.
Each of these has a particular value in the transition and
together will help to keep the transition smooth and logical.

The following were selected on the basis of their collective
value in the transitional process towards providing maximum
feedback from both perspectives, and in promoting a team concept.

1. **Share the Vision of the Future:** It is important to
communicate to the organization how the future will change once the
transition is begun. The stakeholders can then share the vision of
the future and understand what is ahead. This could be
accomplished with a project specific mission statement which would
be used to guide the project through to implementation while
continually serving to remind all of the basic philosophies.

This technique has a value in communicating or "selling" the
change in terms of how it will improve the organization or facets
within it. This reduces uncertainty by articulating the reasons
and hopes behind the change.

The promoting of an organizational culture within the Police
Department stressing professionalism and accountability would also
help to facilitate acceptance of the change and share the vision of
the desired future.

2. **Responsibility Charting:** The transition stage of the
process will break new ground. The use of a responsibility chart
will help to make this process more orderly by using group
consensus to identify the tasks, actions and decisions which should
be part of the transition. These tasks, actions and decisions then are plotted according to the roles most suitable to perform or to be responsible for them. A responsibility chart for this project is contained in Appendix G.

The use of the RASI technique reduces ambiguity and confusion which may result from an improvised process and will promote stability by showing what steps are ahead and how they will be achieved.

3. Team Building Workshops: This method involves members of the organization in an intimate environment which invites participation, focusing on common goals, and making and modifying plans.

Team building results as feelings of mutual agreement or bonding occur as the group becomes involved in the process of giving and receiving feedback. In the case of this project, a team building workshop would help to impart the vision and desired change while building commitment and acceptance.

4. Scenario Writing: Preparation of normative and exploratory scenarios would help to communicate how the organization may look as it should be if the issue is managed, or how it will look if it is not.

Scenarios help facilitate commitment and reduce anxiety by illustrating that the future is manageable, with cooperation and involvement.
5. **Surveys/Questionnaires:** This method will help to obtain feedback concerning how stakeholders may react to the change or what components or areas they feel are important. It provides an input process which can give a sense of partnership or feelings of involvement.

6. **Needs Assessments:** This process involves the analysis of where an issue is at present and the impact or benefits of a change to the organization.

   A needs assessment would benefit the transition in this case as it would assess the present state of efforts by the Surfside Police Department to manage dysfunctional Police Officers and provide a path to the future.

7. **Milestone Recognition:** Using this process, the transition management team will be able to work toward a series of intermediate goals, or milestones incorporated into a timeline.

   For example, one of the first milestones may be 1). the introduction of a draft plan to the City Manager, followed by, 2). presentation to the Board of the Police Officer’s Association, and 3). creation of a transition management team, and so on.

   Typically a timeline or series of prerequisites which must be accomplished are associated with denoting a milestone. (See Appendix H). These could also be feedback points to assess the status of the change.
D. Feedback and Monitoring of the Change:

Feedback and monitoring of the policy should be an ongoing process to ensure that the change continues to respond to the issues that stimulated it.

It will be critical to the continued success of the strategy for a periodic review to occur at each milestone. This should be a formal review in which the goals of each milestone are analyzed. This will help assure that the strategy implementation is continuing and to conduct a reassessment of the environment and other issues to indicate the need to adjust or modify the policy and/or the implementation strategy.

Without regular feedback, the policy could become outdated and fail to address changes in both the internal and external environment.
THE DYSFUNCTIONAL POLICE OFFICER:

MANAGEMENT STRATEGIES FOR THE FUTURE

APPENDIX; ENDNOTES
AND BIBLIOGRAPHY
Appendix A: Qualitative Field Interview

The following persons agreed to participate in the interviews:

1. **Associate Justice Armand Arabian**, California State Supreme Court.


3. **Dr. Martin Reiser**, Ed. D., Director of Behavioral Science Services, Los Angeles Police Department.

4. **Michael Hyams**, Ph. D., Psychology, Personnel Sergeant, Newport Beach Police Department.

5. **Smiley Wilkins**, President Lompoc Valley Chapter NAACP.


Utilizing the expertise of these persons to assess the present and future environment relating to the issue, a series of six questions were formulated and presented to each expert.

The following lists each question and the summarized responses, except those quoted, of each member.

**A. In your opinion, is the current level of management of the issue adequate?**

1. Arabian: No. "A lacking area".
2. Stone: No. Personnel management is currently oriented toward punishment/liability.
3. Reiser: No. "There's more to be done".
5. Wilkins: No.
6. Thomas: "We have the power to do what's necessary".

**B. What trends do you feel may occur which will change the way police management views the issue?**

3. Reiser: Public demanding to be involved; not just recipients of service. "The para-military style is dead".
5. Wilkins: Pressure from public to be more responsive. Changes in demographics.
6. Thomas: Economics. Budget restrictions may result in less people and fewer places to put them.

C. What results could be found in changes in the management of the issue?

1. Arabian: Policemen attuned to protection and service. Improved public support. "Every citizen sees themselves as a Rodney King on a bad night".
5. Wilkins: "All positives". People working together. Greater community support.
6. Thomas: A sense of ownership and cooperation.

D. What do you feel might be the consequences of law enforcement's failure to manage the issue?

1. Arabian: Huge settlements against the police.
2. Stone: "Society is going to have a tea party on our heads".
3. Reiser: Civil unrest. Lawsuits resulting in large civil settlements.
5. Wilkins: Greater distrust of law enforcement. Adverse reactions to negative police events.
6. Thomas: Continuation of present practices.

E. What do you feel are viable alternatives which might be considered in the future management of the issue?

2. Stone: Improvements in employee screening. On going programs to monitor personnel.
5. Wilkins: Connection of police officers with their communities.
6. Thomas: Continuing stress/psychological assessments. Performance has not generally been the problem.

F. Where do you think challenges to changes in management of the issue may come from?

1. Arabian: Police labor unions.
3. Reiser: Police labor. Traditionalists; those with entrenched ideas.
4. Hyams: Labor, others resistant to change.
5. Wilkins: Conservative officials. Lack of/unwillingness to spend funds.
6. Thomas: Resistance of police management. Within the ranks themselves to some extent.
Appendix B: Futures Wheel

The Dysfunctional Police Officer: Future Management Strategies

Challenges to Change of Issue

- Failure to manage issue
  - AWARDS FOR PUNITIVE DAMAGES
  - JUDGMENTS MAY BANKRUPT AGENCY
  - PERSONAL LIABILITY POTENTIAL
  - UNSYMPATHETIC MEDIA COVERAGE OF MISCONDUCT

- PRIVACY RIGHTS OF POLICE OFFICERS
- UNION/LABOR RESISTANCE
- HIGH COST
- ADVOCATES/ACTIVISTS

Prevention and Treatment

- AMERICANS WITH DISABILITY ACT
- EARLY DETECTION AND PREVENTION
- ALTERNATIVES TO DISCIPLINE
- COMMUNITY POLICING
- DEMANDS FOR POLICE ACCOUNTABILITY
- INTOLERANCE OF MISCONDUCT

As means of controlling labor/liability costs

Increased concerns for health issues

75
Appendix C: NGT Panel

1. **Full list of candidate TRENDS developed by the NGT Panel:**

- Training in Management Roles for Supervisors +
- Changing the Police Role to Stress Positive Reinforcement For Officers
- Reassessment of Disability/Stress Retirements/Criteria +
- Public Demands for Better Crime Control +
- Scrutiny of Moral/Ethical Issues +
- Court Rulings Adverse to Police Management +
- Two Tier Employment System +
- Alternatives to Traditional Police Officers
- Community Based Policing
- Positive Reinforcement Systems for Officers +
- Credentialing of Police Officers
- Increasing Emphasis on Employee/Individual Rights
- Para-militarism of Police
- Public Confidence in Police
- Prosecutions of Police Administrators for Employee Misconduct
- Civilian Control Replaces Traditional Police Chief
- Removal of Chief's Discretionary Powers
- Concern for Mental Health Issues of Police Officers **
- Increasingly Complex Role of Police **
- Employment Standard for Police Officers Change **
- Multi-Cultural Conflicts **
- Increasing Costs for Police Services **

+ selected in first voting round.
* selected in second voting round as one of top 5 trends.

2. **Full list of EVENTS developed by the NGT Panel:**

- Elections of Police Chiefs
- Stress Retirements Eliminated (as a cost control)
- American Disabilities Act Prevents Discharge if Job Related Disability (stress, etc.)
- Increase in Civil Liability Costs Makes Small Police Agencies Economically Unfeasible
- Videotaping of Arrests Becomes Common
- Ruling that Police Departments are Liable for Inflicting Stress/Failing to Prevent
- Officer Sues Department For Failing to Train/Treat/Supervise
- Mandated Civil Review Boards (IA Review)
- Requirements Cause Acute Shortage of Suitable Applicants
DNA Testing Validates Psychological Testing
State Cuts Budget for POST Training
City Contracts for Police Services Following Civil Judgements Against Police Department
Mandated Employee Assistance Programs for Public Safety Employees in High Stress Jobs*
Courts Rule that Psychological Testing Violates Privacy Rights*
Military Style Re-Enlistment System Reduces Cost/Promotes Good Conduct
Initiative Passes Limiting Civil Liability Awards*
Confidentiality of Police Records Removed
Mass Resignations After Police Officer gets Prison Term for Violence
POST Mandates Periodic Psychological Testing for Police Officers*
State Supreme Court Issues Ruling Individual Rights Subordinated by Public Good*
Liability for Stress from Job Hazards

* selected in voting to list of top 5 events
Appendix D: List of Stakeholders

The following police managers participated in the Situational Analysis Panel (SAST):  

1. Harry Heidt  
2. S. Calvin Masaoka  
3. Michael Collins (Police Labor Representative)  
4. Harold Morgan  
5. Joseph Bailey  

Full list of stakeholders developed by the Situational Analysis Panel.  

1. Chief of Police  
2. City Council  
3. Police Officer’s Association  
4. City Attorney  
5. Providers of Employee Assistance Programs (EAP’s)  
6. Psychologists  
7. Medical Doctors  
8. Police Officer’s Families  
9. News Media  
10. Activists Groups  
11. Police Officers  
12. Supervisors  
13. Police Managers  
14. Personnel Administrators  
15. Internal Affairs Investigators  
16. Administrators of Americans With Disabilities Act (ADA)  
17. Commission on Peace Officer’s Standards and Training (POST)  
18. Police Academies  
19. Civil Attorneys  
20. Background Investigators  
21. Workmen’s Compensation Administrators  
22. Health Insurance Providers
Appendix E
Assumption Map

Most Certain

Least Certain

Stakeholders:
1. Chief of Police 8. Police Officers
2. City Manager 9. Surfside POA
4. Police Management Staff 11. Personnel Administrator
6. POST
7. Community Activists
Appendix F: Policy Alternatives

Full list of policy alternatives developed from modified policy delphi group. Those shown in bold were selected.

Military style enlistment system for the first 3-5 years of a career.

Mandated psychological assessment with cause only.

Periodic rotation to non-line positions during career.

Changing worker's compensation and retirement laws to create a greater balance between meeting needs of legitimate "dysfunctional offices" and others and not providing what is in effect and incentive to seek compensation or retire due to job stress.

Traditional discipline is replaced by creative means stressing cause oriented efforts.

Police academies change curriculum from para military doctrine to sociology, cultural awareness, communications skills.

Enactment of employment contract options renewable after evaluation of employee work history.

Community involvement (service clubs, volunteerism, etc.) clearly identified as a promotability factor in career promotions.

Supervisory training includes recognition and dealing with dysfunctional personnel.

Recognizing that different employees have different interests/skills, emphasize job matching to place personnel in the right assignment.

Periodic assessment of needs of personnel and efforts by management to training/prepare.

Enact programs which require officers to work with community organizations so that they are not always in an adversary role.

Initial psychological assessment that includes profiling of the employee: a psychological base.

Periodic psychological reassessment compared to base line profile and immediate mitigation treatment based on need.

Recurring interaction between veteran officers and social service assignments.
Department mandated testing programs developed to detect early symptoms of mental and physical disorders.

Department mandated to implement treatment programs that reduce stress in the workplace.

American Disabilities Act mandates departments to retain and accommodate employees who have developed on the job disabilities.

Periodic background investigation update and psychological assessment.

Revise recruiting practices to attract employees with diverse skills, human behavioral/interaction talents.

Creation of "mission statement" for organization and for the individual officers which articulate goals for the future-areas of excellence and improvement.

Sabbatical leave after 5 years of employment.

Creation of para-enforcement jobs which would allow marginal officers to move out of the mainstream yet retain many of the same benefits. Create upward mobility.

Create special law enforcement districts to provide additional services for higher levels of funding.

More participatory management where employees have more input into specific assignments and more flexibility in work methods.

Regular training such as verbal judo, crisis intervention and intercultural awareness.

Rotating assignments, beats, supervisors and duties periodically.

Creation of a "mission statement" for the department to address goals for the future.

Community based policing alternatives.
Appendix G: Current Psychological Tests

1. Allport-Vernon Values
2. Behavioral Police Assessment Device (B-PAD)-Videotest
3. Bender Visual Motor
4. Blake-Mouton Management Grid
5. California Psychological Inventory (CPI)
6. Cattell Culture Fair Intelligence Test (CFIQ)
7. Chapin Social Insight Test
8. Clinical Analysis Questionnaire (CAQ)
9. Edwards Personal Preference Schedule (EPPS)
10. Forer Structure Completion Test
11. Fundamental Interpersonal Relations Orientation-B (FIRO-B)
12. General Aptitude Test Battery
13. Gordon Personality Profile Inventory
14. Guilford-Zimmerman Temperament Survey
15. Hilson Personnel Profile/Success Quotient (HPP/SQ)
16. House, Tree, Persons Drawing (HTP)
17. Inwald Personality Inventory
18. Job Perception Inventory
19. Kahn Symbol Arrangement Test
20. Leadership Practices Inventory
21. Machover Draw A Person
22. Manson Evaluation
23. Meyers-Briggs Personality Type Inventory (MBTI)
24. Minnesota Multiphasic Personality Inventory (MMPI)
25. Motivational Analysis Test (LMAT)
26. Niederhoffer's Cynicism Scale
27. Personal Preference Inventory (PPI)
28. Personal Style Survey
29. Projective Drawings
30. Reid Public Safety Survey
31. Rorschach Test
32. Rotter Incomplete Sentence Blank (ISB)
33. Sacks Sentence Completion Test
34. Shaffer Personality Inventory
35. 16 Personality Factor (16 PF)
36. Stron-Campbell Vocational Interest Blank
37. Szondi Projective Type Test
38. TAIS
39. Test of Attentional & Interpersonal Style
40. Test of Social Insight
41. Thematic Apperception Test (TAT)
42. Vocational Interest Measure (LVIM)
43. Watson-Glaser Critical Thinking Appraisal
44. Wechsler Adult Intelligence Scale (WAIS)
45. Wonderliz Personnel Test
Appendix H: Cost/Benefit Analysis

The following are areas in which costs could be experienced in development, implementation and management of the Code Four Program at the 100 officer Surfside Police Department. Rather than predicting actual costs, areas in which costs could be experienced are shown in parenthesis which would vary in actual application.

I. COSTS (Based on a 7 Year Timeline):

Year 1-2: Research Phase and Negotiation/Implementation Phases

Transition Manager Salary: (1/3 Time Commander)
Clerical Salary: (1/2 Time Clerk)
Travel Expenses: (10 days travel)
Professional Consulting: (100 hours)
- Scenario Development
- Needs Assessment
- Strategic Planning
- Development of Assessment Mechanisms/Tests

Year 3 through 6: Management Phase (shown per year)

Staff Psychologist: (300 hrs/yr)
Salaries:
- Transition Manager (1/4 Time Commander)
- Clerical Support (1 Full Time Clerk)
- Program Manager (1 Full Time Lt.)
- Salary of Assessment Panel Members (400 hrs/yr x 3)
- Overtime Costs for Assessments (4 hrs/yr x 45)
Expanding Wellness Program (Subject to RFP)
Rehabilitation/Extended Counseling Services (As necessary)
Legal Services (appeals) (As necessary)

Year 7: Review/Ongoing Phase

Professional Consulting (50 hours)
- Analysis of Program
- Recommendation for Changes

II. POTENTIAL ADVANTAGES/SAVINGS:
Potential Reduction is Disability/Stress Claims
Potential Reduction in Complaints
Improved Quality/Motivation of Police Personnel
Long Term Improvement in Community Support

III. POTENTIAL LIABILITIES/DISADVANTAGES:
Resistance from stakeholder groups, i.e., police labor
Management Expenses
Labor Intensive Program
# Appendix I: Responsibility Chart (RASI)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Decision of Acts*</th>
<th>Police Chief</th>
<th>Project Manager</th>
<th>Staff Psych’ist</th>
<th>Assessment Panel</th>
<th>Personnel Admin’or</th>
<th>POST</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Formulate Policy</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Feasibility</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>S</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Design Program</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>I</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identify Resources</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Present For Approval</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop Plan to Implement</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>S</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contact with Stakeholders</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop Performance Standards</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negotiate With POA</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Select Assessment Panel</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implement Program</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conduct Ongoing Monitoring</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Legend:
- **R**: RESPONSIBILITY for action (but not necessarily authority)
- **A**: APPROVAL (must approve, has power to veto the action)
- **S**: SUPPORT (must provide resources, but does not have to agree)
- **I**: INFORM (must be informed before action, but cannot veto it)
- Blank: Irrelevant to that action

84
Appendix J: Timeline

**Research Phase: Year 0-1 (Pre-Change State)**
- Identify problem
- Conceptualize policy
- Police Chief to obtain commitment from command staff
- Create initial policy structure
- Initiate contact with POST
- Develop scenarios
- Obtain buy-in from City Manager
- Select Project Manager
- Identify Stakeholders/Key Stakeholders
- Conduct Needs Assessment:
  - Cost/benefit analysis
  - Surveys/Questionnaires to other agencies
- Select Psychologist/Consultant
- Create steering committee of key stakeholders
- Develop Strategic Plan:
  - Micro-mission statement
  - WOTS UP/Situational Analysis
  - Stakeholder analysis

**Negotiation/Implementation Phase: Year 1-2 (Transition State)**
- Project Manager becomes Transition Manager
- Develop Transition Plan:
  - Develop transition timeline
  - Develop negotiations strategy
  - Identify critical mass
  - Identify present/required commitments
- Initiate negotiation with POA
  - Develop assessment criteria
  - Establish assessment process
  - Modify MOU, if necessary
- Identify cost/training requirements
- Present program to City Council for approval
- Expand wellness program
- Select assessment panel
- Involve media
- Develop feedback systems
- Schedule training/team building workshops

**Management Phase: Year 3-6 (Post Change/Future State)**
- Appoint Project Manager
- Schedule assessments
- Questionnaires
- Semi-annual review/modifications

**Ongoing:**
- Monitoring/Feedback monthly to Chief/Project Manager
- Modifications, as necessary
- Survey for desired results
ENDNOTES

10. Ibid., 38.
11. Ibid., 38.
13. Ibid., 181.

17. Ibid., 485.


19. Ibid., 93.


BIBLIOGRAPHY


