

**MICROFICHE**

LAW ENFORCEMENT ASSISTANCE ADMINISTRATION (LEAA)

POLICE TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE REPORT

SUBJECT: A Feasibility Study For the Adoption  
Of Public Safety Services Department  
Arrangement in Clifton, Arizona.

REPORT NUMBER: 76-220/107

FOR: Clifton, Arizona, Police Department

Population:	6,000 (est.)
Police Strength:	10
(Sworn)	(6)
(Civilian)	(4)

Square Mile Area: 7

CONTRACTOR: Public Administration Service  
1776 Massachusetts Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20036

CONSULTANT: Charles D. Hale

CONTRACT NUMBER: J-LEAA-002-76

**NCJRS**

DATE: January 24, 1977

APR 12 1977

**ACQUISITIONS**

40409

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
I. INTRODUCTION .....	1
II. UNDERSTANDING OF THE PROBLEM .....	2
III. ANALYSIS OF THE PROBLEM .....	3
A. The Community .....	3
B. The Police Department .....	4
C. The Fire Department.....	11
IV. FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS.....	14
V. RECOMMENDATIONS .....	16
A. The Public Safety Organization .....	16
B. Personnel Practices .....	18
C. Facilities and Equipment .....	19

## EXHIBITS

### Tables

Table 1. --- Serious Offenses Reported and Cleared, Clifton, Ariz., 1975-76 .....	6
Table 2. --- Comparison of Crime Rate and Clearance Rate, Clifton, Ariz., And Other Arizona Cities, 1975 .....	6
Table 3. --- Police Activity Data, Clifton Police Department, September-December, 1976 .....	8
Table 4. --- Comparison of Current and Recommended Staffing Levels, Clifton Department of Public Safety ..	17

## I. INTRODUCTION

On October 19, 1976, Mr. Donald R. Lane, the Chief of Police of Clifton, Arizona, initiated a request for technical assistance to the LEAA regional office in San Francisco, California, through the Arizona State Justice Planning Agency. The request was ultimately approved, and Charles D. Hale was assigned as the project consultant on January 13, 1977. On-site project work was conducted during the period of January 18-20, 1977.

The original request outlined several areas in which technical assistance was required, including:

1. General management and administration.
2. Organization, staffing, and manpower utilization.
3. Research, planning, program development, and budgeting.
4. Feasibility of adopting consolidated police-fire public safety concept.

During the on-site evaluation process, a number of persons were interviewed; records, facilities, and equipment were inspected; and operating procedures were observed.

Individuals interviewed during the course of the study were:

Mayor Larry Upton  
Councilman Ronald Waldorf  
Town Manager J. R. Pennington  
Chief of Police Donald R. Lane  
Lieutenant Manual Perea  
Sergeant William Dreeland  
Patrolman James Trout  
Fire Chief Salvador Romero

## II. UNDERSTANDING OF THE PROBLEM

The Clifton, Arizona, Police Department is an organization in transition. On the one hand, it suffers from many years of neglect resulting from the absence of effective executive leadership and modern management practices. On the other hand, the Department has, in a relatively brief period of time, realized many accomplishments and shown promise of becoming an effective, dynamic, and professionally oriented police agency. Yet, much remains to be done.

It is neither possible nor practical in a report of this nature to propose detailed recommendations concerning the improvement of police services in Clifton. Nor is it possible to document fully the Department's favorable features. Rather, it is the purpose of this report, which is based upon a brief survey of existing conditions, to identify key problem areas and to propose general guidelines and recommendations for remedying these shortcomings. In this respect, every attempt has been made to take into consideration the limitations of the town's budget so that the recommendations offered will be realistic in suggesting a more effective and efficient method for the delivery of public safety services in the Town.

Because of this state of transition, the Clifton Police Department suffers from many deficiencies. Many of these are relatively minor in nature and are in the process of being remedied. Others, however, are more serious and deserve the careful attention of town officials. These more serious problems, which this report specifically addresses, include the need to:

- Develop a more positive base of support, from both community residents and their elected officials, for moving toward the goals of professional police administration.
- Develop a viable public safety organization which will provide an effective level of both police and fire services for the Town of Clifton.
- Provide adequate training, compensation, equipment, and facilities, for the public safety services.
- Develop strong organizational leadership within the public safety services.

### III. ANALYSIS OF THE PROBLEM

In order to understand the current problems faced by the Clifton Police Department, it is necessary to be familiar generally with the history of the town and its political, economic, and political characteristics.

#### A. The Community<sup>1/</sup>

The history of Clifton dates to the year 1870, when deposits of gold and copper ore were discovered in the mountains near the present site of the town. The Town of Clifton was founded in 1873 and was incorporated in 1909. Throughout its history, the economic base of the town has been tied to the fluctuating fortunes of the copper industry. To this date, the Phelps Dodge Corporation, which operates the large nearby copper mine and smelter operation, is the single largest employer in the area.

Clifton's population is primarily Mexican-American and bilingual. The town itself is beset by money problems, evident in poor zoning, code enforcement, and street maintenance. It relies heavily upon sales tax revenue for its income and of the relatively few services provided, the most important are police, fire, and public works.

Until June, 1976, the town operated under the mayor-council form of government, with standing council committees exercising direct operational control over various municipal departments. A City Clerk was the chief administrative officer in the town. In June, 1976, a new council was elected, and the council-manager form of government was implemented. A Town Manager was appointed shortly thereafter, and the position of City Clerk was abolished.

The Town Council is elected at large for two-year term and consists of seven members. The Mayor is elected by the Council from among its members and serves as the titular head of the government.

The Town Manager and all department heads are appointed by the Council. Department heads include the Chief of Police, the Fire Chief, the Town Attorney (part-time), the Town Magistrate, the Town Engineer (part-time), and the Director of Public Works.

---

<sup>1/</sup> An excellent source of background information on the Town of Clifton is "Everything You Ever Wanted to Know About Clifton," prepared by the Community Development Staff of the University of Arizona Cooperative Extension Service in conjunction with the Clifton Planning Committee in July, 1975.

The appointment of a new Chief of Police in September, 1976, followed shortly after by the selection of the first Town Manager, suggests an increased awareness of the need for modern management practices in the operation of municipal affairs. In particular, the present Chief of Police was hired by the Council for the specific purpose of upgrading and modernizing police operations. It was also the intent of the Council, at the time the new Chief of Police was hired, to create a public safety organization in which the existing police and fire services would be combined.

Many new and promising innovations have been initiated in the Police Department since the appointment of the new Chief of Police. These include an improved records system, partial dispatching service, improved facilities and equipment, and a more aggressive training program for police personnel. While the public safety organization concept has been adopted in principle, no positive steps have been taken to consolidate police and fire services.

## B. The Police Department

### 1. Organization and Staffing

The Clifton Police Department presently consists of six full-time sworn officers, including a chief, a lieutenant, a sergeant, and three patrolmen, one of whom has been assigned additional duties as criminal investigator. The department also employs one part-time patrolman who normally works three days a week; this position, however, is not permanent and may be eliminated at any time. In addition, the department has a reserve force of 10 reserve officers, all of whom are trained and certified by the Arizona Law Enforcement Officers Advisory Council (ALEOAC), the state body responsible for setting minimum police training standards. Reserve officers are normally assigned to supplement the regular patrol force during special events, but from time to time may be used to replace regular officers during acute manpower shortages.

Until only recently the department had no civilian employees and relied on the Greenlee County Sheriff's Department for dispatching service. The department now employs four civilian police dispatcher/record clerks, one of whom is a non-permanent, contract employee. The remaining three are temporary C.E.T.A.<sup>2/</sup> employees whose employment may be terminated after 13 weeks.

Police dispatcher/record clerks perform the dual responsibility implied by their title. Because these individuals are still undergoing on-the-job training and are not competent to work without close supervision, dispatching ser-

---

<sup>2/</sup> Paid under the provisions of the Comprehensive Employment and Training Act.

vice is available only for 16 hours a day. From 12:00 A.M. to 8:00 A.M. dispatching services continue to be provided by the Greenlee County Sheriff's Department. In addition, few of the dispatcher/records clerks can type, and they are generally unfamiliar with basic records-keeping procedures.

Due to limited manpower, the department normally has only one officer on patrol at any one time. The Chief of Police and the lieutenant normally work the day shift, with the sergeant assigned to the evening shift. The remainder of the patrol force (three patrolmen) are rotated among one of three eight-hour shifts. The patrolman-investigator is primarily assigned to investigative activities but also performs regular patrol duties.

The duties of the lieutenant include supervising the administrative affairs of the department, including shift scheduling and compiling statistical activity data. The lieutenant is also responsible for the effective and efficient performance of the police dispatcher/record clerks.

The sergeant has recently been appointed to coordinate the activities of the reserve force and to assist in the planned consolidation of police and fire services under the public safety organization concept.

## 2. Analysis of Police Activities

Because records maintained prior to the appointment of the new Chief of Police were relatively incomplete, it is difficult to produce any reliable analysis of crime trends, traffic problems, and related police activities. The department has maintained fairly comprehensive offense and arrest data for the past two years, however, and Table 1 reflects offense data for serious crimes in 1975 and 1976.

The figures in Table 1 indicate that the Town of Clifton has experienced a relatively stable and low rate of crime in the last two years. The fact that the town is relatively isolated, is not located on a major through highway, and is not situated in a major metropolitan area no doubt accounts for the low rate of serious crime. It can also be assumed that most of the crimes in the town are committed by local residents. This in turn probably accounts for the department's relatively high rate of crime clearance. Normally, an overall clearance rate of 20-25% for serious offenses is considered acceptable. As the data in Table 1 indicate, the Clifton Police Department has recorded a substantially higher clearance rate than would be generally expected. Again, the fact that most crimes are committed by local residents, most of whom are known to the police, is undoubtedly a factor in this high clearance rate.

The crime and clearance rates in Clifton compare quite favorably with those of other small towns in Arizona and with state totals, as shown in Table 2.

Table 1.

Serious Offenses Reported and Cleared, Clifton, Ariz., 1975-76

Offense <sup>a/</sup>	1975			1976		
	No. <sup>b/</sup> Reported	No. <sup>c/</sup> Cleared	% Cleared	No. <sup>b/</sup> Reported	No. <sup>c/</sup> Cleared	% Cleared
Criminal Homicide	0	--	--	0	--	--
Forcible Rape	0	--	--	0	--	--
Robbery	1	1	100.0	1	0	0
Assault	23	20	87.0	16	9	56.3
Burglary	54	4	7.4	30	9	30.0
Larceny	18	6	33.3	17	7	41.2
Motor Vehicle Theft	0	--	--	4	4	100.0
Total	96	31	32.3	68	29	42.6

Notes: <sup>a/</sup>Offenses listed are those typically considered to be the most serious crimes and do not reflect the total range of offenses recorded by the police.

<sup>b/</sup>Excludes offenses reported but later determined to be unfounded.

<sup>c/</sup>Cases are normally cleared through the identification and/or arrest of one or more persons believed to be responsible.

Table 2.

Comparison of Crime Rate and Clearance Rate, Clifton, Ariz.,  
And Other Arizona Cities, 1975.<sup>a/</sup>

Offense Category	Clifton, Arizona		Arizona Cities With Less Than 10,000 Pop.		Arizona Total	
	Rate <sup>b/</sup>	%Cleared	Rate <sup>b/</sup>	%Cleared	Rate <sup>b/</sup>	%Cleared
Criminal Homicide	0	--	8.3	n/a	8.3	77.7
Forcible Rape	0	--	41.7	n/a	34.8	51.6
Robbery	16.7	100.0	106.6	n/a	169.0	36.9
Assault	383.3	87.0	462.3	n/a	325.8	60.4
Burglary	900.0	7.4	1,957.1	n/a	2,502.0	14.8
Larceny	300.0	33.3	4,773.3	n/a	4,693.4	17.8
Motor Vehicle Theft	0	--	405.2	n/a	510.6	16.2
Violent Crimes <sup>c/</sup>	400.0	87.5	619.0	n/a	537.9	52.7
Non-Violent Crimes <sup>d/</sup>	1,200.0	13.9	7,135.5	n/a	7,706.0	16.7
Total	1,600.0	32.3	7,754.5	n/a	8,243.9	19.1

Notes: <sup>a/</sup>Source Arizona Department of Public Safety, Arizona Crime Report 1975.

<sup>b/</sup>Rate per 100,000 population.

<sup>c/</sup>Includes criminal homicide, forcible rape, robbery, and assault.

<sup>d/</sup>Includes burglary, larceny, and motor vehicle theft.

The police in Clifton, as in most other American communities, perform a wide variety of services only indirectly related to crime control. Until only recently, however, the Clifton Police Department did not maintain accurate records of these other "non-criminal" incidents. Table 3 displays overall activity data for the period September-December, 1976. As the data in Table 3 indicate, the Clifton Police Department performs a number of service activities not related to crime and traffic enforcement. A substantial portion of these incidents are routine building security checks which are performed on an assigned basis.

### 3. Personnel Practices

Personnel management is an important element of the police executive function. Among other things, a police chief is responsible for recruiting, selecting, and training police personnel; evaluating employee performance; maintaining discipline; and promoting competent personnel. Other factors important to the appointment and retention of qualified personnel, which are largely beyond the control of the police executive, include providing equitable salaries and fringe benefits. The salaries offered to police personnel in Clifton are among the highest in the state for police agencies, but they are somewhat misleading in that living costs in the Clifton area are substantially higher than in surrounding areas because of the Morenci Mine and its adverse effect upon retail prices. Second, and more important, is the fact that the attractive starting salaries paid to police personnel are not supplemented by equitable fringe benefits. Third, the town does not employ a sliding wage scale to provide periodic pay increases. As a result, an employee, once hired, remains at the same salary level until promoted or until an overall wage adjustment is made.

The salaries currently paid to members of the Clifton Police Department are as follows:

<u>Classification</u>	<u>Per Month</u>
Patrolman	\$ 850
Sergeant	900
Lieutenant	945
Chief of Police	1,200

Table 3.

Police Activity Data, Clifton Police Department, September-December, 1976

Activity	Sept.	Oct.	Nov.	Dec.	Total 4-mo. Period	Average Per Mo.	Est. Annual Total <sup>a/</sup>
Felony Calls	6	4	4	12	26	6.5	78
Misdemeanor Calls	11	44	23	46	124	31	372
Service Incidents <sup>b/</sup>	1,588	1,566	1,595	1,848	6,597	1,649.3	19,792
Security Checks <sup>c/</sup>	1,512	1,512	1,512	1,514	6,050	1,512.5	18,150
Traffic Violations	55	52	47	30	184	46	552
Traffic Accidents	5	9	18	7	39	9.8	118
Animal Complaints	30	4	18	12	64	16	192
Arrests	6	5	8	10	29	7.3	88
Police Reports	180	209	229	309	927	231.8	2,782
Total Incidents	1,901	1,893	1,925	2,274	7,993	1,998.3	23,980

Notes: <sup>a/</sup> Estimate assumes continued level over period indicated and probably is low because of anticipated improvements in reporting procedures.

<sup>b/</sup> Includes a variety of police activities not related to criminal investigation or traffic law enforcement.

<sup>c/</sup> Included within "Service Incidents," above.

While these salaries are very competitive with those paid by surrounding communities, the fringe benefits offered by the town are considerably less attractive, as the following examples show.

a. Overtime -- The town does not compensate police personnel for overtime worked. Instead, each officer receives an additional \$50 per month in direct salary. During the period September-December, 1976, however, the department recorded an average of 14.6 hours overtime monthly for each member of the department, which averages out to \$3.42 per hour even though their regular hourly wage is \$5.32.

b. Compensatory Time -- Town personnel rules provide for compensatory time on an hour-for-hour basis for overtime worked. However, police officers are rarely provided the opportunity to use compensatory time due to scheduling problems and personnel shortages. As a result, there is no guarantee that compensatory time earned will actually be granted.

c. Medical Insurance -- Town employees are not covered by any comprehensive medical insurance plan. The town does provide a fully paid hospitalization and accident insurance plan, but the total coverage is less than complete and dependents are included only if paid for by the employees.

d. Sick Leave -- Town employees are allowed one-half day sick leave per calendar month of employment.

e. Holidays -- The town recognizes seven paid holidays per year. Police employees, however, do not receive pay but rather are given compensatory time off on a straight time basis for holidays worked. As indicated above, though, there is no guarantee that compensatory time earned will ever actually be granted.

f. Uniform Allowance -- The town provides police employees \$25 per month for uniform allowance but does not provide any uniforms or equipment prior to or during employment. A police officer may expect to pay about \$500-\$600 for the initial purchase of uniforms and equipment prior to appointment.

#### 4. Training

Since the appointment of the present chief, the department has pursued an aggressive training program, and every effort has been made to provide a variety of training programs for police personnel. Most of this training is provided at no expense to the town, except for salaries paid to persons attending classes. Due to the limited number of personnel, it is rather difficult to schedule officers to attend classes for more than brief sessions.

Since the added emphasis on training is a rather recent development, its full impact upon the department cannot be fully evaluated. Training records

are being developed but as yet are embryonic. In addition, no funds have been set aside in the current police budget for training. As a result, the training efforts of the department, although energetic, are still rather sporadic and unsystematic.

#### 5. Police Manpower Needs

The present staffing of the Clifton Police Department is barely adequate to provide full-time police coverage for the town. Fortunately, the town has experienced no serious crime or traffic problems, and service demands are relatively modest. The present manpower limitations pose many problems for the police administrator. Among these are difficulties in scheduling personnel for vacation, training, and regular work assignments; in filling vacancies caused by personnel being absent; and providing adequate coverage during special events.

Another important factor is the safety of the individual officer, particularly during the hours of darkness. A single patrol officer on duty at night is exposed to a variety of hazards, even in a town such as Clifton where violence is a relatively rare occurrence. If an officer stops to check out a suspicious person, makes an arrest, or decides to check out an open building, he is virtually without backup support. This is due to the isolated nature of the town (the nearest police department is in Safford, 42 miles away) and the fact that the Greenlee County Sheriff's Department does not have active patrols after midnight.

Consequently, an argument can be made for increasing the level of patrol coverage during evening hours, particularly after midnight, even though the work load does not justify such an increase.

#### 6. Facilities and Equipment

The police facility in Clifton has undergone substantial renovation and improvement under the direction of the present chief, but it still lacks many of the basic amenities that make for effective operations.

The police are housed within a single-story structure that also houses all other town offices except for public works. The police facility consists of a small lobby, a small dispatch room, the chief's office, and another small area in the rear of the building which contains a desk, chair, and file cabinet used by the police lieutenant. The department also utilizes a large walk-in safe which is used to store found property and evidence. Individual lockers are provided for each officer to store items of equipment, clothing, and uniforms.

There is no room provided for interviewing prisoners, suspects, witnesses, or other persons other than the chief's office, and there is no squad room or briefing room. In addition, the facility is quite small and congested and affords

very little privacy for conducting the affairs of the police department.

The equipment provided to the department is unsatisfactory in many respects also. The sole exception to this has been the town's purchase of eight patrol cars, thereby allowing each officer to have a car assigned to him permanently, with two cars remaining as spares. This has apparently proven to be very effective in that each officer is responsible for the general maintenance of his own car.

Routine maintenance on police vehicles is provided by a two-man town maintenance crew, but no preventive maintenance program has been established, and no reliable records are kept, either by the department or by the public works crew, regarding repairs and maintenance costs. The town also does not have a regular schedule for replacing unserviceable police vehicles. The average mileage on the patrol cars at the time the study was conducted was in excess of 50,000 miles. Many police departments plan to replace their police cars at 60,000 miles or thereabouts.

All patrol cars are equipped with emergency lighting and two-way radios. Only a few of the cars have either shotguns and shotgun racks, but more are on order. The department has one radar unit for traffic law enforcement. The only crime scene investigation equipment in the department is the personal property of the Chief of Police, who allows it to be used for departmental purposes. Similarly, the only camera available to the department is owned by the chief.

The town has not provided the department with any library, reference books, or training materials. The Chief of Police has his own personal police library, which is quite extensive, and he makes it available to members of the department. All periodicals and professional journals are also the personal property of the Chief of Police and are paid for by him out of his salary. The radio in the chief's car is also his property.

## 7. Police Records

Except for Uniform Crime Reports, which contain basic information on offenses and arrests, the department kept no records until the arrival of the current Chief. The files and reporting procedures that have been established by the Chief of Police are considered to be a vast improvement over what was before and are also quite adequate for the needs of the Department.

## C. The Fire Department

The Clifton Fire Department consists of a full-time Fire Chief and two full-time fire employees. All three members of the Fire Department were originally appointed by the Town Council. Each member of the Fire Department, including

the chief, works a 56-hour workweek consisting of 24-hours on and 48 hours off. This provides for one man on duty around-the-clock except for absences due to sick leave, vacation, and so forth. When such absences do occur, they are filled by regular personnel, part-time help, or volunteers.

The Town of Clifton also has a Volunteer Fire Department consisting of 16 men; it has its own chief who is not necessarily responsible to the Town Fire Chief. Thus, problems and conflicts often arise in the direction and coordination of firefighting activities.

Unlike police reserves, volunteer firemen are compensated at a rate of \$9.50 per month. To earn this modest allowance, fire volunteers are expected to attend one 2-hour meeting each month in addition to responding to all fire alarms. From this sum is deducted a specified amount for failure to attend scheduled meetings or to respond to fires. The amount deducted is placed in a general fund which the Volunteer Fire Department may use as it sees fit. This money is generally used to pay for parties and similar social activities but is occasionally used to pay for small items of equipment. All members of the Volunteer Fire Department, plus regular firefighters and police officers, have a command conference telephone hook-up in their homes in order that they may be simultaneously notified of a fire alarm.

The Fire Chief is compensated at a rate of \$950 per month, and the two other regular members of the Fire Department are compensated at a rate of \$770 monthly.

The Clifton Fire Department responds to an average of 20 fire alarms each year, most of which are relatively minor grass fires.

Very few of the regular and volunteer members of the Fire Department have received any training in firefighting operations. What training has been received has consisted of one- or two-day seminars put on by the State Fire Marshal's office in town. Except for one volunteer fireman, none of the regular or volunteer firefighters have attended formal firefighting schools.

The Fire Department performs very few inspectional activities, does not have a standard fire inspection schedule or procedure, and has not in the past attempted to enforce fire safety standards or regulations to any degree. This is particularly troublesome in view of the fact that the town has many residential areas which are generally regarded as serious fire hazards.

The Fire Department's response procedures are largely unsystematic, and its firefighting techniques reflect a lack of knowledge of modern fire suppression principles. Moreover, its equipment and facilities are poorly maintained and suffer from a lack of proper attention. Fire trucks are dirty, hoses are not cleaned and properly stored after use, and equipment is stored in the fire trucks in a haphazard manner.

As an example of the poor maintenance of fire equipment, it was observed during the on-site portion of this study that fire hoses and nozzles had been left at the scene of a fire several days after the fire had occurred. At the time this report was being written, the fire hoses still had not been retrieved. In addition, one of the department's auxiliary fire trucks was not removed from the fire scene until four days after the fire occurred; it was finally removed by the Chief of Police after the Fire Department failed to take action.

The current annual budget of the Clifton Fire Department is \$44,447. For this, the town receives little in return: lack of proper management; untrained and basically incompetent personnel; poorly maintained equipment; lack of proper firefighting procedures; and no real fire prevention and safety inspection program.

#### IV. FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

The future of public safety services in the Town of Clifton remains in doubt. Several things happened in late 1976 to suggest that a new direction in the operations of the Clifton Police and Fire Departments was imminent, however. First, a new Town Council was elected, and several of its members expressed dissatisfaction with the existing operations of the Police Department. Shortly thereafter, a new Chief of Police was hired for the express purpose of modernizing the Police Department and consolidating police and fire operations. Shortly thereafter, the first Town Manager was hired to bring to the town modern principles of municipal administration and management. These events suggested that noteworthy improvements in the overall operation of town services would be forthcoming and, indeed, insofar as the Police Department is concerned, substantial gains have been made.

The gains that have been made have not come about painlessly, however, and the future of the town remains clouded. Substantial community resistance to recent improvements has been spearheaded by dissident citizens who see no need to move ahead progressively. Instead, some residents would apparently prefer to turn the calendar back and revert to an era when government was a rather passive, ineffectual activity. Claims have been made, for example, that the Police Department has too many personnel, that they are paid too much money, and that the town has no need for a professional administrator. Others feel that the town is moving ahead too quickly and that a "cooling off" period is needed. Still others decry the fact that local government operations impose too heavy demands upon available revenues and fear future tax increases. Behind all this, the Phelps Dodge Corporation and its Morenci copper mine and smelter operation looms in ominous silence, its operations representing the mainstay of the town's future economic growth and development.

The town and its residents have three options available to them with respect to the future direction of public safety operations. In the final analysis, the choice of either course of action must be a political decision based squarely upon what is best for the people of Clifton. The options are:

1. Total abolishment of the Police Department. The current budget of the Police Department is \$100,370, which represents 19.7% of the town's total government expenditure and a per capita expenditure of \$16.73. The town could easily abolish the Police Department and rely entirely upon the Greenlee County Sheriff's Department to provide basic police protection. Under a contract agreement with the county, the town could undoubtedly realize substantial savings and receive a level of police

protection generally consistent with the expectations of some town residents.

2. Retain the status quo. Under this option, the town could return the Police Department to the status it occupied prior to the appointment of the new Chief of Police. Law enforcement would once again be a relatively low-key operation. The town would continue to pay a substantial portion of its municipal budget for police services and would receive only nominal benefits in return. Personnel and equipment would continue to be used inefficiently by maintaining separate police and fire organizations, neither headed by progressive and professionally oriented chiefs.
3. Continue the current trend. Under this option, the advances made in police operations during the past six months would be continued, and the current momentum in the Police Department would be preserved. Improving and professionalizing the public safety service would be a top priority among elected and appointed town officials, and police and fire services would be consolidated into a single public safety organization.

The choice of options is a matter best left to local decision-makers. This is a decision that must be made only after a careful analysis of the needs and expectations of the community. It is often difficult to convince people what is best for them, even when the evidence supporting a particular course of action seems abundantly clear.

From a professional point of view, and keeping in mind the unique characteristics of the Town of Clifton, there is only one acceptable option. The town should support the continued professional development of the police and fire services through the creation of a consolidated public safety organization. Specific recommendations supporting this course of action are contained in the following section.

## V. RECOMMENDATIONS

### A. The Public Safety Organization

The continued maintenance of separate police and fire organizations, each under different leadership, is neither an effective nor an efficient utilization of manpower. The town would achieve a much more satisfactory return on its investment in police and fire operations through the creation of a consolidated public safety organization under the command of a single administrator. To achieve this end, a totally new organizational structure is needed. This organizational structure would effectively abolish the separate classification of "patrolman" and "firefighter" and replace them with "public safety officers." The proposed organization would consist of the following position:

- 1 Public Safety Director
- 1 Fire Services Coordinator
- 1 Patrol Services Supervisor
- 6 Public Safety Officers
- 1 Senior Dispatcher/Records Clerk
- 4 Dispatcher/Records Clerks

The following is a brief description of how the duties and responsibilities of these positions would be assigned.

1. The Public Safety Director would be responsible for overall direction and command of police and fire operations and would report directly to the Town Manager. Among the duties of the Public Safety Director would be preparing his budget; developing and maintaining fiscal controls and procedures; planning; establishing rules and regulations; and coordinating police and fire operations.

2. The Fire Services Coordinator would perform those duties now performed by the Fire Chief. In addition, the Fire Services Coordinator would assist the Public Safety Director in developing and conducting training programs for public safety officers. He would also be responsible for developing a viable fire prevention and inspection program; supervising the training and operations of the volunteer fire department; inspecting and maintaining equipment and facilities; and developing fire response strategies and techniques.

3. The Patrol Services Supervisor would be directly in charge of regular patrol operations. He would divide his time between field supervision and admini-

strative duties, including scheduling, training, and performance evaluation. He would also supervise the records-keeping and dispatching operations.

4. The Public Safety Officers would be cross-trained in both police patrol and fire prevention and suppression duties. They would be assigned to regular patrol duties as are patrolmen at the present time. In addition to their regular patrol duties, however, public safety officers would also be assigned to fire prevention and inspection duties.

Under normal conditions, four patrolmen would be required to provide 24-hour coverage. A fifth patrolman should be available for relief duties to fill in for absences due to vacations, illness, and training. A sixth position is recommended in order to staff a fourth shift from 6:00 P.M. to 2:00 A.M. This will ensure that at least two officers are on duty during those critical hours of darkness when danger is most prevalent and when police activity levels reach their peak. This is considered to be the minimum staffing level acceptable for the proposed organization.

5. The Senior Dispatcher/Record Clerk would serve dual functions. First, this person would be directly in charge of the department's records-keeping operations. Second, the Senior Dispatcher/Record Clerk would act as relief dispatcher when absences occur. He should receive a salary approximately 10% higher than that paid to Dispatcher/Records Clerks.

6. The Dispatcher/Record Clerks would handle those duties now being performed by the police dispatchers and would also assist in the preparation and maintenance of police records. A minimum of four dispatcher/record clerk positions is recommended in addition to the Senior Dispatcher/Record Clerk in order to provide continuous 24-hour coverage.

Table 4 compares the recommended and the current staffing levels of the Clifton Public Safety Department.

Table 4.

Comparison of Current and Recommended Staffing Levels,  
Clifton Department of Public Safety

<u>Position</u>	<u>Current</u>	<u>Recommended</u>	<u>Differences</u>
Director of Public Safety	0	1	+ 1
Police Chief	1	0	- 1
Fire Chief	1	0	- 1
Fire Services Coordinator	0	1	+ 1
Patrol Services Supervisor	0	1	+ 1
Police Lieutenant	1	0	- 1
Police Sergeant	1	0	- 1

Table 4.  
(Continued)

<u>Position</u>	<u>Current</u>	<u>Recommended</u>	<u>Differences</u>
Patrolman	3	0	- 3
Fireman	2	0	- 2
Public Safety Officer	0	6	+ 6
Senior Dispatcher/Record Clerk	0	1	+ 1
Dispatcher/Record Clerk	4	4	0
Total	<u>13</u>	<u>14</u>	<u>+ 1</u>

By adopting the public safety concept outlined above, an overall increase in police and fire operations effectiveness can be realized with an increase of only one (civilian) position. By equipping public safety officers with the necessary immediate-response fire-suppression training and by providing them with basic firefighting equipment in their patrol vehicles, fire response should be substantially enhanced.

Upon receipt of a fire alarm, one patrol vehicle should immediately respond to the fire scene and take whatever fire suppression tactics are necessary. If a second officer is on duty, he should respond to the fire station and drive the attack truck to the fire scene, unless notified by the first officer at the fire scene that additional response is not necessary.

The volunteer fire department should be preserved, under new leadership and direction. The Fire Services Coordinator should be placed in direct command of the volunteer fire unit and should reorganize the volunteer unit to ensure more effective operations. Volunteer firefighters should be required to undergo a minimum of basic and in-service training in order to remain members of the organization. They should also be required to attend monthly training drills and to assist in basic maintenance and upkeep of fire equipment.

#### B. Personnel Practices

The town has adopted a revised personnel policy giving the Town Manager considerable latitude and direction in various personnel management functions. In addition, a program of periodic performance evaluation is being implemented.

The most critical need at the present time is to reassess personnel compensation practices. In particular, a revised salary schedule consisting of beginning, intermediate, and top salary stages is required. The town should obtain professional assistance in developing a comprehensive classification and pay plan in order to ensure that its compensation practices are equitable and consistent with prevailing compensation practice for comparable jurisdictions in the state.

The town should also reconsider its compensation practices with respect to overtime pay, holiday pay, medical insurance, and retirement. Until adjustments are made in these areas, it is doubtful whether qualified, competent, and highly motivated personnel can be attracted to and remain employed in the Clifton Department of Public Safety.

The Chief of Police should be encouraged and supported in his present efforts to provide suitable training for police personnel. The present training efforts are sporadic and unsystematic, however, and are not part of any long-range plan. To improve the department's overall training program, the following steps are recommended:

First, a training account should be established within the annual budget of the Department of Public Safety. While much training can be obtained for no charge from state and federal authorities, out-of-state training should be acquired also when local training does not satisfy the needs of the department. A specific sum each year should be set aside for this purpose.

Second, the Chief of Police (or Director of Public Safety, as the case may be) should develop a comprehensive, multi-year training plan, consisting of a series of training goals and objectives which lend direction and purpose to training activities.

Third, training programs should be based upon actual individual and departmental needs. That is, a careful analysis of the department's organizational and individual performance and expertise deficiencies should be used as the basis for formulating training objectives.

Finally, training and education should be considered when evaluating individual performance, making assignments, and promoting personnel.

#### C. Facilities and Equipment

The present police facility leaves much to be desired, but it is a vast improvement over what was available six months ago. Nevertheless, the town should realize the inherent restrictions on individual and organizational productivity and efficiency imposed by unsuitable working conditions and should begin planning today for the construction of a new municipal building and public safety facility.

Several recommendations are also offered with respect to equipment:

- First, a preventive maintenance program should be established for all public safety vehicles to ensure that regular maintenance is performed on systematic basis. A careful record should also be kept of all vehicle repair and maintenance costs, and the town should adopt a policy with regard to vehicle trade-in based upon optimum cost-effectiveness ratios.
- Second, the town should authorize the purchase of two crime-scene investigation kits and cameras. One of these kits and cameras should be kept in the field at all times with the other kept in the station as a reserve.
- Third, at least one public safety vehicle should be equipped with basic first-aid and fire-suppression gear in order to provide an immediate response capability at fire scenes. In addition, a set of protective clothing, a fire extinguisher, and other miscellaneous firefighting gear should be carried in each public safety vehicle.
- Finally, the town should authorize funds in each annual budget for equipping a modern police library in order that public safety personnel will have a variety of training aids, books, and reference materials available to them to enhance their own professional skills.



**END**